Meaning Relations on Racism and Racial Discrimination News in the Jakarta Post

Dedy Subandowo* a

Pázmány Péter Catholic University, Hungary

Article Info

Article history
Submitted: 28 November 2020
Accepted: 22 February 2021
Published: 10 March 2021

Keywords:
Critical discourse analysis,
Journalistic discourse, Meaning relations

*Correspondence Address:
Subandowo.dedy@hallgato.ppke.hu

Abstract

This paper addresses meaning relations on racism and racial discrimination news in the Jakarta Post. The study highlights some issues dealing with how media texts provide an opinion concerning equality as well as racist prejudice. One of fundamental elements that must be considered in journalistic discourse is meaning relations between sentences and clauses (Fairclough, 1992). The study involves social inequality, semantic, grammatical as well as equivalence and difference relations. Considering the phenomenon of meaning-making relations in the journalistic discourse, especially dealing with racism and discrimination in Indonesia, this research examines a text published on the Jakarta Post.

INTRODUCTION

There are some media platforms that can be used to spread information. News is one of alternative ways in broadcasting the information. It includes online, mass or electronic media. News can be the way of influencing societies by providing easy access to the information (Mubarak, 2014; Sukma & Utomo, 2016; Chaerunnishah, 2020). Recently, people who do not have much time to buy printed newspapers or magazines, they may easily access online media platforms that are provided by news companies. One of the online news companies in Indonesia is the Jakarta Post. This online newspaper has been popular as Indonesia’s leading English-language daily.

The use of language in mass media includes opinions from societies. Hall (2012) asserts that media language is considered performative communication. It can be the tool of informing, deliberating and witnessing certain attitudes or ideas. Many journalists use this tool to present press reports and construct the social world of journalism. Journalism may become an important field of shaping agendas,
public debate, opinions, identities and social reality information including politics, racism and discrimination to minorities (Fairclough, 1989, 1995; Richardson, 2007). For example, political aspects address the distribution of social goods in interaction, such as power and status which relates to beauty, intelligence, race, gender, sexual orientation and so forth (Gee, 1999).

Text news about racism and discrimination deals with how media texts provide an opinion concerning equality as well as racist prejudice. Todolí, Labarta, and Dolón (2006) claim that media plays a key role either maintaining or worsening of ethnic groups or production of racism. For example, Van Dijk’s (1986) critical discourse on racism has shown that media texts, especially news legitimate and produce ideological frameworks and group power. For this reason, Paltridge (2012) argues that discourse analysis seems to be the way of analyzing language in different views of the world and different understanding, especially the use of language in presenting racism and discrimination published on online newspapers.

Research studies in the field of racism and discrimination on mass media have been conducted by some researchers including Blum (2020), Jackson, (2019), and Green (2018). Blum’s study investigates moral frames for understanding black men killing by the police officers in the United States based on the recorded video. This research results fundamental issues to the widespread public concern about racism and discrimination involving empathy and negative intimacy. Furthermore, Jackson’s dissertation examines the hashtag of black lives matters’ movements and protests in either Twitter or Instagram. He claims that these two social media platforms could be reference for activists or users to address the rise on social justice and improvement. In addition, Green’s article administers how racism and discrimination designate to black community due to their different English.

The foregoing analysis of racism and discrimination relating to the black community in social media appears to show interesting investigations. However, it seems rather limited to find studies dealing with racism and discrimination in connecting with meaning relations particularly the study of black community in Indonesia. As a result, this paper offers an answer to that proposed questions. The main focus of this study deals with Fairclough’s (1992) three-dimension theory in the consideration of semantic relations, grammatical relations, as well as equivalence
and difference of racism and discrimination on social media’s black lives matter.

**Meaning Relations in Clauses and Sentences**

With respect to language journalism, the process of text production seems complex. It involves various elements to convey meaning of a text. One of fundamental elements that must be considered in journalistic discourse is meaning relations between sentences and clauses (Fairclough, 1992). This element examines meaning and semantic relations as well as causal or logical relations between sentences and clauses within sentences. Meaning relations also deal with various grammatical structures. The grammatical structure highlights grammatical and lexical features of the texts. This analysis requires a range of textual markers that correlates between sentences and clauses. Besides, Fairclough’s (2003) textual analysis argues that meaning relations emphasize imperative aspects, which are equivalence and difference. In this sense, equivalence and difference focus on creating and proliferating differences between objects, entities, groups of people as well as collapsing differences by representing objects, entities, groups of people as equivalent to each other (Laclau and Mouffe, 1985).

Based on the foregoing discussion, this paper employs critical studies. The study involves social inequality (Bukhari and Xiaoyang, 2013), semantic, grammatical as well as equivalence and difference relations. Considering the phenomenon of meaning-making relations in the journalistic discourse, especially dealing with racism and discrimination in Indonesia, this research examines a text published on the Jakarta Post.

**RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

This study employs qualitative approach. Page’s et al. (2014) qualitative approach in discourse analysis outlines forms and meanings as well as ideological and social contexts of interaction. It means that a qualitative discourse analysis encompasses a comprehensible understanding of the role of language in communication involving some aspects, such as data and theory, as well as language and society. Furthermore, the employment of critical discourse analysis in this study may represent a language in different views, understanding and social identity construction (I. Fairclough and Fairclough, 2012). Thus, this approach may be able to describe the use of language from different views and understanding of the text of digital news platforms such as the Jakarta Post.
The data analyzed in this study is a text that is linked to an issue of #BlackLivesMatter’s George Floyd. The text is written by Sutrisno (2020) entitled #PapuanLivesMatter: George Floyd’s Death Hits Close to Home in Indonesia. He published the article to the Jakarta Post on Thursday, 4th June, 2020. This text addresses an issue of discrimination of Papuan people who live in Indonesia. It seems that the text involves a point of view from a journalist who correlates the case between George Floyd and Papuan people. The article mainly addresses a topic relating to racism and discrimination as a process of social change in their discourse aspects (Fairclough, 2012). For this reason, this study employs Fairclough’s (1992) three-dimension framework in order to outline the text.

The textual analysis conducted in this study highlights semantics relations between clauses and sentences. The study has given attention to a relation of meaning inclusion, which is called hyponymy (Fairclough, 2003). This term is essential to identify equivalence and difference in representing objects, entities and groups of people. Equivalence and difference classifications are an important aspect in a textual process of meaning-making.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

This research results demonstrate three fundamental aspects addressing semantic relations, grammatical relations, and equivalence and difference. Semantic relations incorporate into causal, additive, elaboration, temporal, and contrastive relations. Grammatical relations directly connect with paratactic relation, hypotactic relation, reference, vocabulary, and cohesion. Equivalence and difference deal with classification, identification and representing objects, entities, groups of people.

Discussion

Semantic Relations

Causal relation

“As the death of George Floyd, an African-American man who died while being arrested in the United States, sparks a global outcry, Indonesian rights advocates and young people have stepped forward to remind fellow citizens that racism has long been an issue at home as well.”
The text shows that a complex prepositional phrase which presents at the beginning of the sentence may indicate an important aspect of the clause. The phrase indicates something that happens during a specific time. It acts as a causal relation that results in a global outcry. The conjunction as in “As the death of George Floyd an African-American man who died while being arrested in the United States” generates other clauses to compare a situation that has the same condition with the United States. The comparison is racism that also happens in Indonesia. “Indonesian rights advocates and young people have stepped forward to remind fellow citizens” is the main clause that responds to the as clause. It shows that the sentence involves the same characters and situations in two different countries, which are Indonesian and the United States. Therefore, as is not only a conjunction connecting clauses but also it is a reason when something else is taking place.

Additive relation

Another element of meaning relations is indicated by a conjunction of and. This conjunction connects two main clauses to indicate equal information as well as to add new information. The example taken from the text shows that additive relations may occur in different forms with different markers.

“The killing of George Floyd in Minneapolis must be a reminder that discrimination and intimidation also happen to native Papuans in Indonesia, and most of the cases have yet to be resolved,” executive director Usman Hamid said on Wednesday.”

“The rights group also urged the authority to immediately release 51 Papuan prisoners of conscience. “They do not deserve to be in jail because they did not commit any crimes. Justice must be upheld,” Usman said.”

The two foregoing paragraphs have shown that both connectors and and also link between clauses and sentences. The first paragraph, and is an additive relation that informs a new topic. The topic of the initial sentence is located in a sub-clause “that discrimination and intimidation also happen to native Papuans in Indonesia”. The main clause “Most of the cases have yet to be resolved” may relate to the previous topic by introducing a new topic which is “the case have yet to be resolved”. The second paragraph refers to connect the topic “most of the
case" with “51 Papuan prisoners of conscience”. The differences between these two conjunctions are and circulate meanings around its clause within the sentence, while also associates sentences with the foregoing paragraph.

Elaboration relation

An elaboration relation relates to a sentence or clause involving exemplification or rewording explanation.

“In other circumstances, such as when engaging in peaceful rallies to voice their political aspirations, many Papuans have reportedly faced physical intimidation and brutality by law enforcement personnel.”

“Actress Hannah Al Rashid, for instance, is among those who have amplified such discussion and called for people to actively listen instead of making assumptions about the issue through her Twitter account”.

“As the death of George Floyd, an African-American man who died while being arrested in the United States sparks a global outcry”...

It seems that two exemplifications have a salient role in those sentences. They are located at the beginning of sentences. It indicates that the use of such as and for instance may lead to a specific circumstance in an embedded clause including other circumstances which points to “Papuans have reportedly faced physical intimidation and brutality by law enforcement personnel” and “Actress Hannah Al Rashid” who uses her twitter account to amplify such discussion. Furthermore, a rewording explanation has given to a name of George Floyd. It emphasizes that he represents “an African-American man who died while being arrested in the United States, sparks a global outcry”. This shows that elaboration relations may always present at the beginning of the sentence to show that a special situation needs to pay attention.

Temporal relation

A temporal relation has prominent implication between two clauses. An indicator of this relation generally begins with a conjunction when.

“In other circumstances, such as when engaging in peaceful rallies to voice their political aspirations, many Papuans have reportedly faced physical intimidation and brutality by law enforcement personnel.”
The sentence is a single sentence consisting of two clauses. The initial clause is a sub-clause that is indicated by subordinate conjunction “when engaging in peaceful rallies to voice their political aspirations”. This clause is not possible to separate from another clause which is the main clause “many Papuans have reportedly faced physical intimidation and brutality by law enforcement personnel”. In terms of clause positions, a sub-clause may precede before or after the main clause. This means that the relationships between main and sub-clauses are temporal and occur only in specific condition.

Contrastive relation

Contrastive relation occurs when there is contradiction between clauses or sentences. This meaning relation is essentially indicated by contrastive conjunctions such as but, against, instead of and so forth.

"Let’s start speaking up for Papua. The government has been able to perpetuate impunity in Papua because the people haven’t spoken out. We do need your voices but please be mindful in amplifying Papuan voices,” Veronica said."

“Amnesty International Indonesia also called on the government to take a strong stand against systemic racism by guaranteeing Papuan rights to freedom of expression and stopping all forms of violence against those who peacefully express their opinions.”

The first paragraph consists of there sentences and but is to contrast between public and Papuan voices. The second paragraph consists only one sentence and encompasses two counter statements with “...against systemic racism...” and “...against those who peacefully express their opinions”. This argument addresses to the government that has power to protect their people, especially Papuans who have reported violence during expressing their opinions and rights of freedom.

Grammatical Relations

Paratactic relation

Paratactic relation or parataxis is one of imperative elements in semantic relations. It deals with realization of grammatical and lexical (vocabulary) features of texts. Parataxis focuses on equal and coordinate grammars.

“President Joko "Jokowi" Widodo has tried to reach out more with his development and infrastructure approach but critics and activists argued
that Jakarta continues to fail in addressing human rights issues and the repression against their freedom of expression.”

The foregoing paragraph exemplifies a coordinate relation. It can be easily seen that but connects to contrast a preceded independent clause, which is formed in a past time. The first clause “President Joko "Jokowi" Widodo has tried to reach out with his development and infrastructure approach” indicates an action that has recently finished. In responding to this clause, a contrast marker, but, must be followed by a past form clause “critics and activists argued that Jakarta continues to fail”.

Hypotactic relation

Hypotaxis relation plays a major role in grammatical relations. It refers to a relation between main and subordinate clauses. In this sense, hypotaxis is a subordinate clause that connects a main clause with subordinate conjunctions.

“Some people think that the racism experienced by Papuan people is a logical consequence that must be accepted by those who are considered separatists,” said Rico, who is also the spokesman for the Indonesian People’s Front for West Papua (FRI-WP).”

The occurrence of hypotactic form relation may be indicated by various aspects including references, lexical (vocabulary) and conjunctive relations.

Reference

Some references are used in the text to indicate particular people, groups, societies or events. The reference alludes to back to earlier sentences or forward to later one.

“On Sunday, Indonesian human rights lawyer Veronica Koman and two native Papuans held an online discussion on how the #BlackLivesMatter campaign had echoed the Papuan movement against the long-standing racism and injustice they felt in Indonesian society.

They agreed that the string of protests against Floyd’s death was similar to what happened in Papua last year -- when thousands rallied against racism after a Papuan student was called a "monkey" by security personnel in Surabaya, East Java.

Many Indonesians support the hashtag #JusticeForGeorgeFloyd to denounce the actions of the American police over racial discrimination
against black people. This is inversely proportional to when Papuans are racially abused,” Papuan activist Rico Tude tweeted on Tuesday.”

The reference in the first paragraph shows a personal pronoun they referring back to the earlier sentence, which is Papuans. The pronoun they address all people considered as Papuan who echo against long-standing racism and injustice. The definite article preceded the #BlackLivesMatter campaign has shown not only a movement for certain people, but it becomes a voice for black people who are racially discriminated and abused. Therefore, the reference emphasizes to a special situation not only against skin colors and stereotypes but also justice for the death of killing black people. In the second paragraph, the reference they refer to people who are mentioned at the beginning of the first paragraph. It shows that the second and first paragraphs are considered relevant elements of sentences. Besides, a forward reference occurs in an indefinite article a Papuan student to be connected to a monkey. The reference of this in the third paragraph is called as a non-restrictive or non-defining reference (Fairclough, 2003). This reference is considered as an element of a sentence because it refers back to the foregoing sentence which is an act of supporting the hashtag #JusticeForGeorgeFloyd. It also stresses that this demonstrative reference points out discrimination as well as unequal actions in the direction of Papuan people who are racially abused.

Vocabulary

There are some predictable patterns of words that constitute other words through the texts. The patterns include an associated word with previous sentences and lexical relations.

“The scene of Floyd being restrained by a cop employing a knee-to-neck hold is familiar for some, who compared the incident to the 2016 case of Obby Kogoya, a Papuan man whose head was reportedly stepped on by the police before he was arrested during the siege of a Papuan student dormitory in Yogyakarta.

“Many Indonesians support the hashtag #JusticeForGeorgeFloyd to denounce the actions of the American police over racial discrimination against black people. This is inversely proportional to when Papuans are racially abused,” Papuan activist Rico Tude tweeted on Tuesday”
President Joko “Jokowi” Widodo has tried to reach out more with his development and infrastructure approach but critics and activists argued that Jakarta continues to fail in addressing human rights issues and the repression against their freedom of expression.”

The words cop and police in the first paragraph associate with verbs being retrained and stepped on. These two past verbs show lexical chains that connect to a police officer. The second paragraph, discrimination, racial abuse, black people are relevant to the hashtag #JusticeForGeorgeFloyd. It means that we can predict what words that may come after mentioning the hashtag. The last paragraph, a lexical chain is mentioned in the first sentence. President Joko “Jokowi” Widodo as a person who has authority in Indonesia denotes to a central place of government which is Jakarta where all his staff are located.

Cohesion

The last grammatical relation between sentence and clause is cohesion devices. This device links one sentence to another sentence by indicating a marker. The example of cohesion in connecting the sentence can be seen in the following paragraphs.

Some students previously told The Jakarta Post that they faced rejection by landlords when looking for rooming houses to rent only because they were Papuans, while others had to endure racial slurs.

In other circumstances, such as when engaging in peaceful rallies to voice their political aspirations, many Papuans have reportedly faced physical intimidation and brutality by law enforcement personnel.

The text shows that the second paragraph begins with “In other circumstances”. It has a function to connect a sentence in a preceded paragraph with a sentence in an embedded paragraph. The device refers to two categories of the same prejudice. The first is rejection by landlords and the second unjustness refers to physical intimidation. The occurrence of cohesive devices leads to a clear comparison within the text.

“Amnesty International Indonesia also called on the government to take a strong stand against systemic racism by guaranteeing Papuan rights to freedom of expression and stopping all forms of violence against those who peacefully express their opinions.
The rights group also urged the authority to immediately release 51 Papuan prisoners of conscience. “They do not deserve to be in jail because they did not commit any crimes. Justice must be upheld,” Usman said.

Another example is also, which is used to add more information related to the previous sentences that have been mentioned. It includes the way how the rights group, Amnesty International Indonesia, has conducted some action due to Papuan’s discrimination. The action deals with asking for the government to promote equality and take a strong stand against discrimination and racism as well as for the authority to release 51 Papuan prisoners. The rights group convinces the government that those prisoners do not commit crimes. The cohesive device does not only connect the sentence within the text, but it also gives extra equal information to previous sentences.

**Equivalence and Difference**

With respect to semantic relations between clauses and sentences, equivalence and difference are considered fundamental aspects in terms of classification, identification and representing objects, entities, groups of people. The classification shapes how people think and act as social agents. In this time, the classification of the text includes words, phrases and clauses that may relate or contrast to each other. Thus, classification of equivalence begins with co-hyponym and it follows with hyponyms. The next category presents left and right contradictions.

**Equivalence**

Based on the text, it can be drawn that meaning-making relations are classified into three major classifications, which are meaning relations to the hashtag #BlackLivesMatter and #PapuanLivesMatter, the public and the activist.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hyponym</th>
<th>Co-hyponym</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#BlackLivesMatter</td>
<td>#JusticeForGeorgeFloyd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>George Floyd’s death</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>an African-American man who died while being arrested in the United States</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The killing of George Floyd in Minneapolis
American police over racial discrimination against black people
protest against Floyd’s death

The hashtag #BlackLivesMatter uncovers various aspects in global calls for taking strong stand against racism and discrimination. It also shows that the hashtag has strong power to provoke many layers of people asking for justice due to black people’s death. The hashtag not only does involve individuals but also covers groups, societies and communities including American police and national sphere of the United States as well as international outrages. It is worth noting that the hashtag #BlackLivesMatter has generated global awareness of equality, justice and life.

Table. 1.2 relational meanings of #PapuanLivesMatter

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Equivalence</th>
<th>Co-hyponym</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#PapuanLivesMatter</td>
<td>incident to the 2016 case of Obby Kogoya a Papuan man whose head was reportedly stepped on by the police before he was arrested during the siege of a Papuan student dormitory in Yogyakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>racial discrimination and violence that Papuans have long endured</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Papuans are racially abused</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the racism experienced by Papuan people is a consequence that must be accepted by those who considered separatists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the history of Papuan political attitudes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>many native Papuans have to put up with discrimination against their skin colour and stereotypes while searching for a better life in other cities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>they faced rejection by landlords when looking for</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12
The hashtag #PapualLivesMatter, on the other hand, has shaped understanding of Papuans’ lives against long-standing racism and injustice in the context of Indonesian society. The text shows that many Papuans endure physical intimidation and brutality when expressing their opinions in the public. It seems that racism in Papuan people mostly refers to stereotypes and physical appearances. The prevalence of the hashtag #PapuanLivesMatter is adapted from the #BlackLivesMatter campaign. The discrimination and injustice undergone by Papuans have linked to a political issue in the Papuan history. Therefore, the word of separatists is addressed to Papuans which lead to racial discrimination and violence in Indonesia. The text views that the protest against racism in Indonesia deals with rights in expressing their voice as well as equality in social life. The Papuans address Indonesian government and public to act towards injustice and racism due to their better life across the nation. The hashtag #PapuanLivesMatter may not seem to deal with what George Floyd has experienced, but racism and racial discrimination must ultimately eliminate from any countries.

**Difference**

In terms of difference, there are elements in the text that seem to be familiar due to equivalence and difference relations. It means that the writer uses expressions to discrete a view from two different categories. Hence, the view in the text is based on the focus of voices against racism in Indonesia. Therefore, this following difference sums up the relations.

**Table. 1.3 Relational Meanings of Difference**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The public</th>
<th>The activist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• support the hashtag</td>
<td>• remind fellow citizens that</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Difference
#JusticeForGeorgeFloyd

- reach out more with his development and infrastructure approach

- is a logical consequence that must be accepted by those who are considered separatists

- perpetuate impunity in Papua

- reached out for discussion

- actively listen instead of making assumptions about the issue through her twitter account

- held an online discussion

- help disseminate information on issues surrounding Papua and shared links for people to sign petitions and donate to various causes to help Papuan people

- compiled the links and reading material on the website

- fear the risk of discussing sensitive topics related to Papua or lamented the history of Papuan political attitudes

- continuous to fail in addressing human rights issues and the representation against freedom of expression

- reached out for discussion

- held an online discussion

- Open their mind and listen to the aspirations of Papuans and be willing to criticize the state for its mistakes

- Be mindful in amplifying Papuan voices

- feel obligated to understand our own country

- need to talk, have these conversations, donate whenever and whatever we can and demand justice where it’s needed

- called on the government to take a strong stand and against systemic racism by guaranteeing Papuan rights

- urged the authority to immediately releases 51 Papuans
The left-hand column lists expressions which are worked into a relation of equivalence with the public against racism in Indonesia through semantic relations, the right-hand column list another set of expressions which are considered equivalent to the activists against racism in Indonesia. These two columns are set up based on the semantic relations of contrast. It involves sentence markers, hedges or conjunctions in realizing the relations, including unlike, while, instead of and so forth.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

Related to meaning relations are displayed in the news text, processes in language production clearly emphasize semantic, grammatical as well as equivalence and difference relations. Fairclough’s three-dimension theory covers text analysis (description), processing analysis (interpretation) and social analysis (interpretation). This approach stands for the complexity of language elements including causal, additive, and elaborative, temporal and contrastive relations. Besides, the text uses composite features to underline special points including conjunctions, reference and lexical chains. In terms of equivalence and difference, the study shows two different categories of roles, which are the public and the activist. Their role represents the way how categorization supports against racism and racial discrimination.

This study carries possible implication for other researchers to conduct a future direction in relevance to Fairclough’s three-dimension theory. The considerable analysis for this field involves language construction in a spoken discourse.
REFERENCES


