ELT IN A GLOBALIZED WORLD: THE BOUNDARIES AND BEYOND

Higher Order Thinking Skills Integrated in Reading Activities of *Modul PJJ Bahasa Inggris* for Ninth Grade Students in Indonesia: A Content Analysis

Bintang Tyatira [a][1], Siti Drivoka Sulistyaningrum [b]

[a] Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Jakarta, Indonesia
[b] Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Jakarta, Indonesia

Abstract

Higher Order Thinking Skills in reading are crucial to be developed among students in this 21st Century. Especially for students who are still in Junior High School level as the materials that are mostly given for their final assessment in Ujian Nasional are reading materials with HOTS included in the test. However, the kind of reading activities provided in course-books for English subjects for Junior High School level in Indonesia for the past few years showed that higher-order thinking skills are barely presented. Moreover, course-books for English subjects keep changing to adjust the needs for students' outcomes and the research on the integration of HOTS specifically in reading tasks in current English course-books for Indonesia Junior High School level is also considerably limited. Thus, this study, which applies a content analysis method, aims to analyze how the HOTS, that are corresponding to the Revised Bloom's Taxonomy, are incorporated in reading activities that are in line with the reading materials provided in the English module that is currently used for the Junior High School level in Indonesia during the pandemic era, Modul Pembelajaran Jarak Jauh untuk Bahasa Inggris. This study reveals that the lower-order thinking skills outnumber the higher-order thinking skills, thus the module needs an improvement in terms of the activities' instructions and question stems.

Keywords: English module; higher-order thinking skills; reading activities

Introduction

Reading is one of the vital language skills for people to learn how to use a language for many purposes. In schools, reading skill has been taught through variant ways in the form of variant topics, usually adjusted according to the students' level. In this 21st Century, reading cannot be satisfyingly done simply by knowing what the text means and is about. We are expected to find out the information implied in the reading text, process it by relating to other information, then conclude what can be done with the information or create new information. Sucipto and Cahyo (2019) added that reading is a process of comprehending a text and gaining new knowledge and information from it. Thus, reading itself acquires not only the ability to read, but also to sort out the content, idea, and message that are implied from a textual form. This activity cannot be achieved without acquiring higher-order thinking skills.

---

[1] Corresponding author.
  E-mail address: bintangtyatira_1212820004@mhs.unj.ac.id

Higher-order thinking skills are part of the cognitive processes defined in the revised version of Bloom's Taxonomy. Based on the overview of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy by Krathwohl (2002: 215), there are six levels of cognitive processes skills to determine the accomplishment of learning objectives, there are *remember*, which refers to regaining relevant knowledge from the memory, *understand*, which refers to establishing the meaning of instructional messages, *apply*, which refers to employing certain procedures in a given situation, *analyze*, which refers to sorting out components of information and find out how the components relate to one another and to an overall structure or purpose, *evaluate*, which refers to constructing resolutions or judgments according to certain standards or criteria, and *create*, which refers to establishing new products. These six levels are divided into two levels, in which *remember*, *understand*, and *apply* are sorted into lower-order thinking skills (LOTS), while *analyze*, *evaluate*, and *create* are sorted into higher-order thinking skills (HOTS). Nourdad, Masoudi, and Rahimali (2018: 231) believed that HOTS is the "the highest level in the hierarchy of cognitive processes, arises when someone gets new information, keeps in memory and links it to the existing knowledge and generates this information to achieve a goal or solve a complicated situation". Mayer (2002), as cited in Dewayani, Ngadiso, and Sarosa (2020: 127), stated that HOTS demand more than just receiving new information and knowledge, it also requires students' active participation in learning and also the students' ability to apply the information into new contexts and construct new knowledge. Furthermore, Heong, Yunos, Hotman, Hassan, Kiong & Mohamad (2012) stated that HOTS requires the ability to process and apply the information in order to answer the questions or uncertainty and then questioning new situations. Susanti et al. (2020) added that these skills are important since they can be useful for people nowadays to solve complicated and complex problems in real-life situations. Therefore, higher-order thinking skills are highly required among all people to be prepared in receiving and spreading information, knowledge, and ideas, so they will be able to apply relevant knowledge into various contexts and establish new knowledge from it. In Indonesia, HOTS is also considered important as it is stated that to build the students' ability to analyze, value, and create new understanding from what they had acquired during the learning process, the use of HOTS is required as strategies in teaching English (Retnawati, Djidu, Kartianom, Apino, & Anazifa, 2018, as cited in Susanti et al., 2020). Hence, the kinds of material and tasks that are used for students should be integrated with HOTS to shape their reasoning, inferring, and decision-making.

A textbook or course-book is known as one of the tools consisting of materials, instruction, and assessment for teachers and students to achieve learning purposes. Integrating the HOTS aspects in reading activities provided in course-books might help the students in improving their thinking skills since it might involve the students directly in learning processes. The Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (2019), cited in Gupta and Mishra (2021: 9305) pointed out that participating actively in the learning process might portray students' competencies in high-level analysis, creativity, and communication skills. Then, Pratiwi (2015) added that Bloom's Taxonomy is constantly

used as the standard in developing the learning objectives, also a categorization of difficulty levels for materials and tasks provided in the books used for the learning. Therefore, since reading is mostly used as an input activity during a learning process, it is better to include lots of higher-order thinking strategies in reading activities provided in the course-books that are in line with Bloom's Taxonomy in order to help the students to shape their HOTS, such as critical thinking, creative thinking, decision making, and so forth.

Several studies about HOTS integrated into reading materials and tasks had been done before. Daniati and Fitrawati (2020) investigated the HOTS integrated into reading exercises that were included in an English textbook entitled "*Bright an English*" for ninth-grade junior high school students by Erlangga (2018). The result showed that the coursebook was more dominant in providing LOTS questions rather than the HOTS. A similar result was found by Pratiwi (2015) as she analyzed whether the content of an English workbook titled *Can Do 2: Practice book* is appropriate according to the Revised Bloom's Taxonomy, and the result showed the workbook inserted the *remember* level of cognition, which is part of lower-order thinking skills, the most compared to the higher-order thinking skills. Another study related to the incorporation of HOTS in the English coursebook was also done by Margana and Widyantoro (2017). However, they focused on developing some examples of tasks integrated with HOTS for reading activity that could be included in English course-books for Vocational High School students in Yogyakarta after investigating the English course-books that were used by the participants of the study, and then, the tasks were tested among the participants. Their study revealed that the respondents, which were students and teachers, showed a positive response towards the orientation of HOTS in their English course-books. Another study was also done by Febrina, Usman, and Muslem (2019) who investigated the cognitive domains of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy provided in an English textbook entitled *Bahasa Inggris SMA/MA/SMK/MAK grade 11th semester 1*. They focused on analyzing the questions in reading comprehension tasks of the course-book with the adoption of a content analysis checklist from Pratiwi (2015) based on Bloom's revised Taxonomy. It was revealed that HOTS domains in the textbook are highly dominant rather than the LOTS.

The kind of English course-books are evolving as the era and the kind of outcomes and competence expected from the students are changing. The related studies mentioned before are mostly focused on investigating the coursebooks that were published and used several years ago. The coursebook that is used nowadays must be different in terms of the contents compared to the previous coursebooks, and as a result, the research specifically done to examine the HOTS in the current course-book is considerably still limited. Since the world is currently fighting the pandemic of COVID-19, the educational system is transforming into a world of digitalization. Thus, lots of schools around the world applied the use of e-module, which supports distance learning among students and teachers while it also makes it easier for students to learn anywhere and anytime with its features that are different from the conventional book or module. Trilestari and Almunawaroh (2020) claimed that besides its flexible use,

it can also provide the students with interactive features and assessments. So, the use of e-module is promising to help students to learn in a more interesting way. However, in balancing the enjoyable function of the e-module, the contents (materials, instructions, assessments) included also need to be considered. The problem is that the measurement of higher-order thinking skills in the current e-modules is still rare. Therefore, to contribute in research about the integration of HOTS in the current reading materials and tasks in Indonesia, this content analysis study aims to analyze the higher-order thinking skills that are included in the English e-module that is currently used by 9th Grade students in Indonesia, which is *Modul Pembelajaran Jarak Jauh untuk Bahasa Inggris*, with the question that is expected to be answered through this study: to what extent do the higher-order thinking skills are included in the *Modul PJJ Bahasa Inggris untuk kelas IX*? This study might become an important study as it concerned the reading activities quality included in the current course-book, which is in the form of an e-module, that point out whether the module provided enough higher-order thinking skill or not.

Research Methodology

The researcher applied a content analysis method for this study, which White and Marsh (2006: 22) defined as "a systematic, rigorous approach to analyzing documents obtained or generated in the course of research". Hence, in line with the purpose of the content analysis method, the researcher analyzed the current course-book or e-module for ninth-grade students, which was provided by the Minister of Education and Culture in Indonesia to support the distance learning of all students in an effort to reduce the spread of COVID-19, to find out the amount of higher-order thinking skills are included in the module. This e-module consists of 2 sub-modules or topics with 4 lessons in each module. The 4 lessons in each topic resemble presentation, practice, and production activities in a learning process, in which Lesson 1 "What Do You Know About It?" and Lesson 2 "Why Not Explore More?" represent the presentation section, Lesson 3 "Will You Practice?" represent the practice section, and Lesson 4 "Will You Perform It?" represent the production section. Each lesson consists of 3 to 14 reading activities. The researcher specifically analyzed the instructions and questions given in the activity section in each lesson only, without including the evaluation part. Table 1 showed the coding for each instruction and question included in the e-module, in which I stands for instructions while Q stands for questions. The instrument of this study was a table consist of six cognitive levels of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy. A list of instructional verbs and examples of question starters provided by Anderson and Krathwohl (2001) also Denise Tarlinton (2003) were used to help the researcher categorize the instructions and questions in the e-module. The result of the study will be shown in the form of a table consist of the topics, lessons, and the six domains of the cognitive level of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy, which are *remember*, *understand*, *apply*, *analyze*, *evaluate*, and *create*.

Table 1. Coding of the instructions and question in the e-module

Topics	Lessons	Coding	Instructions and Questions (Activities)
Let Me Tell You	What do you know about it?	**I1**	**Activity 1** Read the text about bacteria below to state whether the statements are true or false.
		I2	**Activity 2** Match the English words/phrases with the Indonesian meanings by drawing lines.
		Q1 **Q2** **Q3** **Q4** **Q5**	**Activity 2** Answer the questions that follow. 1. What is the writer's purpose in writing the text? 2. Where can you find such texts? 3. Where do fungi live? 4. Are fungi categorized as plants? 5. Write three facts of fungi based on the text.
		I3	**Activity 3** Write and say five facts about mites based on the monolog.
	Why not explore more?	**Q6** **Q7**	**Activity 1** Read the text about ants below. Then, answer the questions. 1. What is the writer's purpose in writing the text? 2. Which information can you find from the text? Complete the table.
		I4	**Activity 2** Read the explanation below carefully to understand the parts of information report texts.
		I5	**Activity 3** Label the parts of the text.
		Q8 **Q9**	**Activity 3** Answer the questions! 1. What is the purpose of the writer in writing the text? 2. Which information can you find from the text? Complete the table.
		I6	**Activity 4** Read the explanation below carefully to understand the grammar and vocabulary in the information report texts.
		Q10 **Q11** **Q12** **Q13**	**Activity 5** Answer the questions. 1. What is the writer's purpose in writing the text? 2. Which information can you find from the text? Complete the table. 3. Find the grammar used in the text. Complete the table. 4. Find the vocabulary in the text. Complete the table.
		I7	**Activity 6** Pay attention to the texts in Activity 1 and Activity 3. Do you find the similarities between the two texts? Write their similarities in the table below.

		I8	**Activity 7** Watch the video about nematodes by clicking the link below. Then, complete the script of the video.
		I9	**Activity 8** Watch the video about ants by clicking the link below. Then, complete the script of the video.
		I10	**Activity 9** Pay attention to the videos in Activity 7 and Activity 8. Do you find similarities between the two videos? Write their similarities in the table below.
	Will you practice?	**I11**	**Activity 1** Complete the information report text about earthworms based on the information given.
		I12	**Activity 2** Based on the text you have completed in Activity 1, retell the information about earthworms to your teacher and friends.
		I13	**Activity 3** Watch the video about worms by clicking the link below. Then, complete the video summary.
		I14	**Activity 4** Write an information report text about millipedes based on the information in the box.
		I15	**Activity 5** Look for information about centipedes. Then, write an information report text about centipedes based on the information you have.
		I16	**Activity 6** In pairs, prepare and give a presentation about centipedes based on the text that you make in Activity 5.
		I17	**Activity 7** Watch the video about slaters/woodlice by clicking the link below. In pairs, retell the information about the video to your teacher, family, or friends.
	Will you perform?	**I18**	**Activity 1** Watch the video about rabbits by clicking the link below. Individually, rewrite the information about rabbits from the video to your teacher, family, or friends.
		I19	**Activity 2** Write an information report text about rabbits based on the information that you have to search based on the table. You may add more information from various sources.
		I20	**Activity 3** Read the text about moles below. Then individually, retell the information about moles that you get from the text to your teacher, friends, or family.
		I21	**Activity 4** Look for information about soil spiders. Then, write an

			information report text about soil spiders based on the information you have.
		I22	**Activity 5** Individually, prepare and give a presentation about soil spiders based on the text that you make in Activity 4.
Rhythm of Life	What do you know about it?	**Q14** **Q15** **Q16** **Q17** **Q18**	**Activity 2** Answer the questions below in groups. 1. Who are the song's targetted listeners? Explain the reasons. 2. What is the song about? Mention the key words to help you decide it. 3. What do you think the writer's reasons for composing the song? 4. Why do you think there are two languages in the song? 5. What is the meaning of the phrase 'reach for the stars'?
		Q19 **Q20** **Q21** **Q22** **Q23**	**Activity 4** Answer the questions below in groups. 1. Who are the song's targetted listeners? Explain the reasons. 2. What is the song about? Mention the key words to help you decide it. 3. Why do you think the song writer composed the song? 4. What might be the reasons for composing the song in relation to the event? 5. What does the phrase 'this is the moment of truth' mean?
		Q24 **Q25** **Q26** **Q27** **Q28** **Q29** **Q30** **Q31** **Q32** **Q33**	**Activity 7** Discuss the answers to the questions below in groups. 1. Who are the song's targeted listeners? Explain the reasons. 2. Why do you think the song is composed? 3. To whom does the word 'aku' in the song refer? 4. What event does the clause of 'setiap saat setiap waktu - keringat basahi tubuh' refer to? 5. What kind of event does the clause of 'ini saat yang kutunggu - hari ini kubuktikan' refer to? 6. What does the clause 'sejarah kupersembahkan' mean? 7. What does the section of Chorus 1 up to chorus 2 try to say? 8. What is the function of Chorus 3? 9. What is the importance of Chorus 4? 10. What is the importance of the Chords?
		I23	**Activity 8** Analyze the three songs and compare them. Find the similarities and the differences among the three of them in pairs.
		I24	**Activity 10** State whether the match of English words or phrases and the Indonesian meanings are true or false in groups.
		I25	**Activity 11** Complete these following statements with the right words or phrases in groups.
		I26	**Activity 12** Read some statements about the song and state whether they are true or false in groups.

	Why not explore more?	**I27**	**Activity 1** Read it carefully and find the right words to replace the images in line with the context. Write your answers
		I28	**Activity 2** Reason your answers and write the Indonesian version of the sentences containing the answers in this table.
		I29	**Activity 3** Read aloud those words and pay attention to the pronunciation model provided by your teacher.
		I30	**Activity 4** Read the text aloud based on the model pronunciation from the teaching media provided by your teacher.
		Q34 **Q35** **Q36** **Q37**	**Activity 5** In pairs or groups of four, reread the text and discuss the answers to the following questions. 1. What does the text talk about? Explain what makes you think this way. 2. Why do you think the songwriter has written the text? 3. What is the message that the text tries to tell? Tell the reason(s). 4. Do you think the message applies to you or your life? Why do you think so?
		Q38 **Q39** **Q40**	**Activity 6** Study this picture and answer the questions in groups. 1. Who do you think the people in the pictures might be? 2. What makes them together? Give your reason. 3. Is there any relationship between the text you read before and the picture of the people? Explain your answers.
		I31	**Activity 7** Listen to the rhythm and pronounce the lyrics accurately.
		I32	**Activity 9** Answer the questions individually by completing the sentences with your own words or choosing the best words or phrases in brackets based on the lyrics.
		I33	**Activity 10** Answer the questions below individually by completing the sentences with your own words or by choosing the best words or phrases provided.
		I34	**Activity 12** Fill in the blanks with the right pronouns that are provided.
		I35	**Activity 13** Match these terms into their appropriate parts found in the lyrics.
		I36	**Activity 14** Let's compare the two songs.
	Will you practice?	**I37**	**Activity 1** Find the English words or phrases that share the same meanings as the Indonesian words or phrases.

			I38	**Activity 2** Read it carefully and understand the lyrics.
			Q41 **Q42** **Q43** **Q44** **Q45** **Q46** **Q47** **Q48** **Q49** **Q50**	**Activity 3** Answer the questions correctly based on the previous song lyrics. 1. What is the title of the song? 2. Who are the songwriters of the song? 3. Who is the singer? 4. What does the song tell you about? 5. Who will love this song? 6. What is the function of the song? 7. What is the possible role of the person referred to as 'I' in the lyrics? 8. To whom does the pronoun 'you' probably refer to based on the lyrics? 9. What is the possible background setting of the song? 10. What are the possible similarities shared by the character 'I' and 'you'?
			I39	**Activity 4** Choose the best choice to answer each question.
			I40	**Activity 5** Complete the chart below by using the correct English words with a friend.
			Q51 **Q52** **Q53** **Q54** **Q55**	**Activity 6** Discuss the answers to the questions in groups. 1. What is the connection between the picture and the title of the movie? 2. Can you guess the connection between the two characters shown in the picture? 3. Why is the song important for the movie? 4. Do the song lyrics tell the whole story of the movie? 5. Who will love the movie?
			I41	**Activity 7** Here is an English song lyric. Read it carefully.
			Q56 **Q57** **Q58** **Q59** **Q60**	**Activity 8** Answer the questions. 1. What is the title of the song? 2. Who are the songwriters of the song? 3. Who is the singer? 4. What does the song tell you about? 5. Who will love this song?
			I42	**Activity 9** Choose the best choice to answer each question.
			I43	**Activity 10** Complete the blanks with the right words based on the contexts.
			Q61 **Q62**	**Activity 11** Discuss the answers to the questions in groups. 1. What is the movie about? 2. Can you guess the connection between the song lyrics and the movie?

		Q63	3. Why is the song important for the movie?
		Q64	4. Who will love the movie?
		Q65	5. Which part of the movie do the song lyrics tell us?
	Will you perform?	**I44**	**Activity 1** Individually study the picture and pay attention to the details.
		Q66 **Q67** **Q68** **Q69** **Q70** **Q71** **Q72** **Q73** **Q74** **Q75**	**Activity 2** Answer the questions about the picture individually. 1. What picture is it? 2. How many songs does this album have? 3. Who is Luther Van Dross? 4. Whose voices do you think you will listen in this album? 5. What does the song possibly talk about? 6. What event does 'Dance with My Father' phrase refer to? 7. When was the song launched? 8. Who launched the album? 9. What kind of feeling may a singer have when he/she sings this song? 10. Have you ever danced with your father? Explain your answer.
		I45	**Activity 4** Find the song lyrics that share the same meaning by paying attention to the lyrics' whole context.
		I46	**Activity 5** Fill in the blanks with the appropriate words.
		I47	**Activity 6** Read aloud the song lyrics below while watching the video.
		Q76 **Q77** **Q78** **Q79** **Q80**	**Activity 7** Answer the questions below individually. 1. Who are the song's targeted listeners? Explain the reasons. 2. What is the song about? Mention the key words that help you to think so. 3. Why do you think the song is composed? 4. What can cause the innocence of a child to be removed? 5.. Why are the prayers more for the mother than for the father
		I48	**Activity 8** Read the song lyrics below, watch the video, and practice your pronunciation.
		Q81 **Q82** **Q83** **Q84** **Q85** **Q86** **Q87**	**Activity 9** Answer the questions below individually. 1. What are the people in the picture doing? 2. How many female member/s does the band have? 3. What do you think how the composer feels during the composing process? 4. What feeling do you have after reading the lyrics or listening to the song? 5. What does the song possibly tell us about? 6. What message does 'Mother like mine' phrase try to tell? 7. When was the song launched?

	Q88	8. Who produced the album?
	Q89	9. Who is the singer?
	Q90	10. What feeling may a singer have when they sing this song?
	I50	**Activity 10** Find the parts of the song lyrics that share the same meaning.

Result and Discussion

Table 2 below showed the result of this study, which is the analysis of HOTS integrated in the e-module *Modul PJJ Bahasa Inggris untuk Kelas IX*. Overall, there were 168 instructions and questions. Based on the result of the analysis, the number of instructions and questions that represent the *understand* level of cognition was the highest among all levels, with a total of 95 out of 168 items or 56,5 in percentage. The second highest among all levels is *remember* level of cognition, with a total of 41 out of 168 instructions and questions. Then, *apply* level of cognition was found with a total of 13 out of 168 instructions and questions. Meanwhile, *analyze* and *evaluate* levels of cognition, which are included in the HOTS, were spotted with a total of 23 and 2 out of 168 instructions and questions or 13,7 and 1,2 in percentage. Unfortunately, create, which is considered as the highest level of cognition and HOTS, could not be found among all instructions and questions that were analyzed.

Table 2. Instructions and questions in the module according to six levels of Cognitive Processes by Revised Bloom's Taxonomy

Items	Cognitive Level					
	Remember	**Understand**	**Apply**	**Analyze**	**Evaluate**	**Create**
Instructions	I1, I2, I4, I5, I6, I29, I30, I31, I35, I37, I38, I40, I41, I44, I47, I48	I3, I8, I11, I12, I13, I16, I17, I18, I20, I22, I24, I25, I26, I27, I28, I32, I33	I9, I14, I15, I19, I34, I39, I42, I43, I45, I46, I50	I7, I10, I21, I23, I36,	-	-
Questions	Q2, Q3, Q4, Q5, Q7, Q9, Q11, Q12, Q13, Q15, Q20, Q41, Q42, Q43, Q54, Q56, Q57, Q58, Q61, Q65, Q67, Q68, Q72, Q73, Q75, Q82, Q87, Q88, Q99	Q1, Q6, Q8, Q10, Q14, Q16, Q17, Q18, Q19, Q21, Q22, Q23, Q24, Q25, Q26, Q27, Q28, Q29, Q31, Q32, Q33, Q34, Q35, Q44, Q45, Q46, Q55, Q59, Q60,	Q47, Q48	Q30, Q36, Q38, Q39, Q40, Q49, Q50, Q51, Q52, Q53, Q62, Q63, Q76, Q78, Q79, Q80, Q83, Q90	Q37, Q74	

		Q66, Q69, Q70, Q71, Q77, Q81, Q84, Q85, Q86				
Total	35	95	13	23	2	-
	20,8%	56,5%	7,7%	13,7%	1,2%	-

The result also implied that this module is mostly dominant with activities integrated with lower-order thinking skills rather than higher-order thinking skills. In fact, this *Modul PJJ Bahasa Inggris* did not include all levels of cognition, only 5 levels were inserted. If we refer to what Mayer (2002) said in the previous section, it meant that this module was mostly intended in helping students receive new knowledge only, with barely guiding them with the application towards various contexts or producing new products from the knowledge. This result is mostly proven by the fact that the questions provided in this module are mostly asking the students about the things that are already explicitly stated in the reading texts. That kind of question is less suitable in shaping students' higher-order thinking skills. Widana (2017: 36) claimed that the kind of questions to assess the three levels of higher-order thinking skills are the questions that are able to measure students' ability to discover, compare, and describe specific parts related to each other, then provide a result with the logical reason (*analyze*), confirm the credibility of information, and point out the implicit assumption from information (*evaluate*), and lastly the ability to solve problems and construct new knowledge (*create*). In addition, it is clear that the module did not include any activity that engaged students to construct their own new knowledge because there was no such level of cognition found in the module.

Therefore, the answer for the question of this study, which is *to what extent do higher-order thinking skills are included in the Modul PJJ Bahasa Inggris untuk kelas IX?* is that there were only small amounts of instructions and questions that represent the two higher levels of cognition, which were *analyze* and *evaluate*, found in this module. Both levels were found in a total of 25 out 168 instructions and question stems. Despite being designed to adjust the current situation and demands of education, this e-module showed similar result to the previous studies by Daniati and Fitrawati (2020) and Pratiwi (2015), who investigated the older version of course-books, in which the module was more dominant with lower-order thinking skills. This also implied that the e-module was more dominant in engaging students to remember, understand, and apply the information that is explicitly mentioned in the reading texts while barely provided the students with the activities that are suitable to shape their decision-making, critical thinking, problem-solving, and creativity. It is unfortunate that the result of this study showed that this e-module was still lacking in providing suitable activities' instructions and question stems that would engage students in developing their creativity, critical thinking, decision

making, and problem-solving in spite of its enjoyable and interactive functions. Hence, the instructions and activities in this e-module need improvement to become a more suitable supporting tool for students in developing their higher-order thinking skills.

Conclusion and Suggestion

Despite being one of the important skills in this 21st Century education, higher-order thinking skills are still rarely inserted into lots of the course-books or modules used to support the learning process. The objectives, materials, and assessments included in course-books or modules need to be more evaluated as they will determine the success of the teaching and learning process. Especially in this era, where most students could only learn through distance learning, the course-book or module might become their only source to learn. As the students are expected to have the ability to analyze, evaluate, and create based on their relevant knowledge, it is crucial to provide them with the suitable activities that will shape their higher-order thinking skills. The course-books or modules as the supporting tools of the learning process have to be more improved to adjust the students' requirements in this digitalization era of education 4.0, with the emphasis on engaging students' active involvement in building the knowledge and ability to apply the knowledge into various contexts and produce new knowledge. Teachers also need to pay attention to the modules or course-books that they are going to use as they need to make sure that the contents are suitable and challenging enough to shape the students' higher-order thinking skills and help both teachers and students in achieving all the learning objectives.

References

Anderson, L. W., & Krathwohl, D. R. (2001). *A taxonomy for learning, teaching and assessing: A revision of Bloom's Taxonomy of educational objectives: Complete Edition*. New York: Longman.

Daniati, N., & Fitrawati. 2020. High order thinking skill questions in reading exercises (An analysis of reading exercises in Bright an English Course Book for the grade IX of Junior High School, published by Erlangga in 2018). *Journal of English Language Teaching*, 9(2), 368–375. https://doi.org/10.24036/jelt.v9i2.108543

Dewayani, G. P., Ngadiso, N., & Sarosa, T. 2020. Insufficient higher order thinking skill in reading comprehension exercises of an English language textbook. *ELT Worldwide: Journal of English Language Teaching*, 7(2), 125–135. https://doi.org/10.26858/eltww.v7i2.14476

Febrina, Usman, B., & Muslem, A. 2019. Analysis of reading comprehension questions by using Revised Bloom's Taxonomy on higher order thinking skill (HOTS). *English Education Journal (EEJ)*, 10(1), 1-13. Retrieved from http://www.e-repository.unsyiah.ac.id/EEJ/article/view/13253/10123

Gupta, T. & Mishra, L. 2021. Higher-order thinking skills in shaping the future of students. *Psychology and Education*, 58(2), 9305-9311. https://doi.org/10.17762/pae.v58i2.3696

Heong, Y. M., Yunos, J. M., Othman, W., Hassan, R., Kiong, T. T., & Mohamad, M. M. 2012. The needs analysis of learning higher order thinking skills for generating ideas. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 59, 197–203. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.09.265

Krathwohl, D. R. 2002. A Revision of Bloom's Taxonomy: An overview. Theory Into Practice, 41(4), 212–218. http://www.jstor.org/stable/1477405

Margana & Widyantoro, A. 2017. Developing English textbooks oriented to higher order thinking skills for students of Vocational High Schools in Yogyakarta. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 8(1), 26-36. http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0801.04

Nourdad, N., Masoudi, S., & Rahimali, P. 2018. The effect of higher order thinking SKILL instruction on EFL reading ability. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature*, 7(3), 231-236. http://dx.doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.7n.3p.231

Pratiwi, N. 2015. Analysis of English workbook for SMP/MTS by using revised bloom taxonomy. (thesis). Retrieved from https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Analysis-of-english-workbook-for-SMP%2FMTS-by-using-Pratiwi/24b2b6cfafd4b6cde225985d3abe742303a15bd2

Sucipto, S., & Cahyo, S. D. 2019. A content analysis of the reading activities in "Bright 2" an English textbook for junior high school students. *English Language Teaching Educational Journal*, 2(1), 13-21. https://doi.org/10.12928/eltej.v2i1.918

Susanti, A., Retnaningdyah, P., Ayu, A. N., & Trisusana, A. 2020. Improving EFL students' higher order thinking skills through collaborative strategic reading in Indonesia. *International Journal of Asian Education*. 1. 43-52. https://doi.org/10.46966/ijae.v1i2.37

Tarlinton, D. 2003. Creating, evaluating, analyzing, applying, understanding, remembering - Bloom's Revised Taxonomy: Creating, generating new ideas. Retrieved from http://slideplayer.com/slide/6356429/

Trilestari, K., Almunawaroh, N. F. 2020. E-Module as a solution for young learners to study at home. *Proceedings of the 4th Sriwijaya University Learning and Education International Conference (SULE-IC 2020)*, 513, 364–369. https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.201230.132

White, M.D., & Marsh, E.E. 2006. Content analysis: A flexible methodology. *Library Trends*, 55(1), 22-45 doi: 10.1353/lib.2006.0053

Widana, I. W. 2017. Higher Order Thinking Skills Assessment (HOTS). *JISAE Journal of Indonesian Student Assessment and Evaluation*, 3(1), 32-44