



The analysis of different perceptions between Avoskin and Wardah skincare consumers

Shafira Putri Bahari, Reny Fitriana Kaban*, Hidayat Sofyan Widjaja

Faculty of Economics and Business Perbanas Institute, Jakarta, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:

Halal certification
Brand ambassador
Beauty vlogger review
Different perceptions
Skincare

ABSTRACT

Wardah is one of the halal cosmetic brands that provides products suit to the needs of Indonesian women. According to Top Brand Award data for 2020, most of Wardah's products experienced a decline in buying interest. The decrease in the percentage of interest in buying Wardah skincare products can be caused by the shift of consumers to other brands. Buying interest is how likely a consumer is to buy a brand and service or how likely a consumer is to move from one brand to another, so this study aimed to analyze different perceptions between two skincare consumers, Avoskin and Wardah, using the variables of halal certification, brand ambassador, and beauty vlogger review. The sampling technique used in this study was purposive sampling, taken from the respondents. This study used the Mann-Whitney test as the data analysis method. The result shows that there are significant differences in perceptions of halal certification among Avoskin and Wardah consumers, no significant differences in brand ambassador perceptions among Avoskin and Wardah consumers, and no significant differences in perceptions of beauty vlogger reviews among Avoskin and Wardah consumers.

1. Introduction

Young women often feel insecure, which is often defined as a form of insecurity about one's own beauty. This is due to the frequent comparisons of themselves with others. Aside from that, insecurity can also arise because of beauty standards in society which say that beautiful women are white, clean, and free of acne. When they feel that they are not in accordance with existing beauty standards, they try to beautify themselves by using beauty products such as skincare and make-up.

Wardah is one of the halal cosmetic brands that provides products according to the needs of Indonesian women. According to Top Brand Award data for 2020, most of Wardah's products experienced a decline in buying interest. The decrease in the percentage of interest in buying Wardah skincare products can be caused by the shift of consumers to other brands. Buying interest is how likely a consumer is to buy a brand and service or how likely a consumer is to move from one brand to another [1]. In addition, the decreased interest in buying Wardah skincare products can be influenced by consumer perceptions. Perception is the process by which a person selects, organizes, and interprets input in the form of information, which can create meaning to produce an overall picture [2]. Based on sales data in e-commerce in 2021, Wardah occupies the 5th position under Avoskin, which is conventional skincare, but its sales are higher than Wardah, which is a halal brand. In Indonesia, a country with a Muslim majority, halal should be used as a lifestyle, but in fact, Avoskin is superior to Wardah in terms of sales in e-commerce.

Avoskin is a skincare that has a cruelty-free label, which means no animal testing. This proves that Avoskin does not use chemicals that harmful to the skin. Avoskin always puts product safety first for its users. With the concept of green beauty, which

is different from most other skincare products [3], [4]. The decline in buying interest of Wardah skincare is due to consumer perceptions of the beauty industry, which has become commonplace. However, manufacturers must keep trying to increase sales by understanding the factors that influence consumer perceptions of Wardah skincare. Based on the results of previous research, it shows that perceptions can be influenced by halal certification [5], [6], brand ambassadors [7], and beauty vlogger reviews [8]. These factors are expected to increase sales.

Halal certification is a guarantee of the halalness of a product and assures consumers of its cleanliness, health, and legal guarantee that the product is feasible to buy and use [9], [10], [11]. Halal certification is to provide confidence to consumers that the product is guaranteed halal [12]. Iltiham & Nizar added one indicator for healthy assurance in product with halal certification is the ingredient used for the product can be assured is safe for face and body [13].

Study from Teng and Wan Jamilah about investigating student's awareness and usage intention towards Halal labelled cosmetics and personal care products in Malaysia has proved that 507 respondents (89.1%) are aware about Halal cosmetics and personal care products but 62 respondents (10.9%) never heard about that [14]. While previous research conducted by Muizzuddin and Kisty showed that the halal awareness of consumers affects their buying decisions [15]. Brand ambassadors are tools that companies use to communicate and relate to consumers in the hope that brand ambassadors can increase sales [16]. A brand ambassador is used as a promotional tool to influence and persuade consumers to use a product [17]. Although a result conducted by Lailiya showed that brand ambassador does not affect the buying interest of cosmetics among female faculty students [18]. A beauty vlogger

* Corresponding author.

Email: reny.fitriana@perbanas.id

Received: 2 April 2022; Revision: 2 July 2022;

Accepted: 7 July 2022; Available online: 17 July 2022

<http://dx.doi.org/10.36055/jiss.v8i1.14712>



is someone who creates and uploads videos about beauty, such as make-up and skincare [19]. Chen & Dermawan found that beauty vlogger review significantly affect consumer buying interest, the better credibility and review given by the beauty vlogger, it will increase the consumer buying interest [20].

Research about perception of Wardah product conducted by Suprianto and Sinduwiatmo showed respondents had good perception about Wardah cosmetics product because Wardah is halal and safe. It is considered halal because the label or certification and made by natural ingredients plus no pig oil. It is also considered safe because the guaranty from National Agency of Food and Drug Control [21]. While research about the perception of Avoskin skincare conducted by Isrofi showed respondents had good perception on the product quality of Avoskin skincare which affect to their purchasing decision [22].

Finding the effect of perception of halal label or halal certification to consumer purchasing decision for cosmetics products, particularly Wardah has been done in previous studies, but focusing on its specific variant, the skincare, has not been done before. Moreover, in this study, the perception of halal certification of Wardah product is compared to the Avoskin Product which has no halal certification, but has different label with green concept which is assumed that makes the sales increase rapidly. In this modern and virtual era, other factors which affect the purchasing decision for current cosmetics consumer are the brand ambassador and beauty vlogger review. In this study, these two factors are also compared between the Avoskin and Wardah consumer groups to find differences in perceptions. Through this research, both manufacturers (Wardah and Avoskin) are expected to get the insight for arranging strategy to increase consumers buying interest in order to win the tough and dynamic competition, beside giving valuable knowledge regarding halal certification, and updated marketing communication tools.

2. Material and method

This study aimed to determine three variables, namely halal certification (X1), brand ambassadors (X2), and beauty vlogger review (X3), as the independent variables. The operational variables for each variable were described in Table 1-3.

This research used a descriptive-quantitative approach. The unit of analysis of this research was the consumer group Avoskin and Wardah. The variables studied in this study were halal certification, brand ambassador, and beauty vlogger review. The type of data was primary data obtained from questionnaires distributed to respondents using Google Forms. Respondents in this study were consumers who used and purchased Avoskin and Wardah skincare products through e-commerce sites Shopee and Tokopedia and were domiciled in Greater Jakarta.

The sampling technique used was purposive sampling. The sample of this research consisted of 35 respondents from Avoskin consumers and 35 respondents from Wardah consumers. The data were processed using the SPSS software version 22 to the validity test, reliability test, normality test, homogeneity test and Mann Whitney test.

3. Results and discussions

This section discusses the results of the validity test, reliability test, normality test, homogeneity test and Mann Whitney test.

3.1. Analysis of the validity test

Validity is a test to prove that a measurement scale can be called valid. The result of the validity test can be seen in the Table 4.

Table 1.
"Halal Certification" operational variable

Variable	Indicators	Performance
Halal Certification [23]	I am convinced that it is halal.	I buy Avoskin or Wardah products based on the presence or absence of a halal logo. I can distinguish original and fake halal logos. For me, buying products with the halal logo is a must.
	Ensure cleanliness.	I'm sure Avoskin or Wardah products are guaranteed to be clean. I'm sure Avoskin and Wardah products are guaranteed sterile.
	Convinced of its health	I'm sure the ingredients used by Avoskin and Wardah are of high quality. I'm sure Avoskin and Wardah products are good for face and body health. I feel comfortable using Avoskin and Wardah products.
	The legal guarantee	I'm sure Avoskin and Wardah products are legally guaranteed by LPPOM MUI I'm sure Avoskin/Wardah products are in accordance with Islamic Shari'a law.
	The form of government concerns	I believe that the product's halal certification is issued by an official MUI institution.

Table 2.
"Brand Ambassador" operational variable

Variable	Indicators	Performance
Brand Ambassador [24]	Visibility	The Avoskin/Wardah brand ambassador is a popular artist. I knew these brand ambassadors long before they became Avoskin/Wardah brand ambassadors. The Avoskin/Wardah brand ambassador has a good personality. The Avoskin/Wardah brand ambassador has a good image.
	Credibility	Brand ambassadors have expertise in communicating products well. Brand ambassadors have good product knowledge. A brand ambassador is a person who can be trusted.
	Attraction	Brand ambassadors have physical attractiveness. A brand ambassador is a person who is able to captivate and amaze respondents through his achievements. Brand ambassadors are able to inspire respondents.
	Power	The brand ambassador is a person who deserves to be followed. A brand ambassador is a celebrity figure who is suitable to be an idol.

Table 3.
“Beauty Vlogger Review” operational variable

Variable	Indicators	Performance
Beauty Vlogger Review [25]	Trustworthiness	I believe the beauty vlogger's statement in the video. I'm sure beauty vloggers provide honest and objective reviews. A beauty vlogger conveys the advantages and disadvantages of the product without exaggerating and understating.
	Expertise	A beauty vlogger is a person who is an expert in the field of beauty. The beauty vlogger communicates information in a clear and understandable manner. Beauty vlogger thoroughly reviews products.
	Attractiveness	I'm intrigued by the beauty vlogger's appearance. I think beauty vloggers have a good sense of appearance. I love the facial expressions and body language beauty vloggers use when reviewing products. I'm interested in seeing the beauty vlogger's skincare routine.
	Respect	I feel amazed by the beauty vlogger's ability to communicate. I feel that I want using the products reviewed by beauty vloggers.
	Similarity	I am a person who likes facial treatments. I like things related to skincare. I feel the beauty vlogger's skin type is the same as my skin type. I feel that the beauty vlogger's facial skin problems are the same as my facial skin problems. I think the skincare reviewed/used by the beauty vlogger fits my needs.

Table 4.
“Halal Certification” validity test

Variable	Items	Avoskin			Wardah		
		r-value	r-table	Status	r-value	r-table	Status
Halal Certification	X1.1	0.644	0.334	Valid	0.488	0.334	Valid
	X1.2	0.651	0.334	Valid	0.499	0.334	Valid
	X1.3	0.781	0.334	Valid	0.398	0.334	Valid
	X1.4	0.592	0.334	Valid	0.435	0.334	Valid
	X1.5	0.613	0.334	Valid	0.539	0.334	Valid
	X1.6	0.615	0.334	Valid	0.623	0.334	Valid
	X1.7	0.553	0.334	Valid	0.597	0.334	Valid
	X1.8	0.378	0.334	Valid	0.590	0.334	Valid
	X1.9	0.465	0.334	Valid	0.683	0.334	Valid
	X1.10	0.855	0.334	Valid	0.620	0.334	Valid
	X1.11	0.541	0.334	Valid	0.735	0.334	Valid

Table 5.
“Brand Ambassador” validity test

Variable	Items	Avoskin			Wardah		
		r-value	r-table	Status	r-value	r-table	Status
Brand Ambassador	X2.1	0.716	0,334	Valid	0.569	0,334	Valid
	X2.2	0.697	0,334	Valid	0.737	0,334	Valid
	X2.3	0.658	0,334	Valid	0.898	0,334	Valid
	X2.4	0.702	0,334	Valid	0.875	0,334	Valid
	X2.5	0.577	0,334	Valid	0.850	0,334	Valid
	X2.6	0.650	0,334	Valid	0.789	0,334	Valid
	X2.7	0.856	0,334	Valid	0.783	0,334	Valid
	X2.8	0.461	0,334	Valid	0.663	0,334	Valid
	X2.9	0.732	0,334	Valid	0.842	0,334	Valid
	X2.10	0.752	0,334	Valid	0.793	0,334	Valid
	X2.11	0.684	0,334	Valid	0.772	0,334	Valid
	X2.12	0.788	0,334	Valid	0.822	0,334	Valid

Based on the results of the halal certification validity test, brand ambassador, and beauty vlogger review for Avoskin and Wardah consumers, it can be concluded that all statement items in each variable are valid. All items have a value of r arithmetic > r table of 0.334 (n = 35, significance level 0.05), so it can be said that all items in each variable are valid.

3.2. Analysis of reliability test

Reliability is a test carried out to determine the reliability of the measuring instruments used in research. This test is carried

out to show the consistency and stability of a score or measurement scale. The result of the reality test can be seen in the Table 7 and 8.

The research data was tested using the Cronbach's Alpha method. Cronbach's Alpha has a provision that if the value of Cronbach's Alpha is 0.60, then the data has good reliability. And conversely, if the value of Cronbach's Alpha is 0.60, then the data has poor reliability. Based on tables 7and 8, it can be said that all variables can be said to be reliable because the results of Cronbach's Alpha show that all variables have a Cronbach's Alpha value of more than 0.60, meaning that the instrument is considered reliable or trustworthy.

Table 6.
"Beauty Vlogger Review" validity test

Variable	Items	Avoskin			Wardah		
		r-value	r-table	Status	r-value	r-table	Status
Beauty Vlogger Review	X3.1	0.771	0.334	Valid	0.765	0.334	Valid
	X3.2	0.828	0.334	Valid	0.743	0.334	Valid
	X3.3	0.830	0.334	Valid	0.795	0.334	Valid
	X3.4	0.627	0.334	Valid	0.779	0.334	Valid
	X3.5	0.749	0.334	Valid	0.681	0.334	Valid
	X3.6	0.582	0.334	Valid	0.871	0.334	Valid
	X3.7	0.531	0.334	Valid	0.871	0.334	Valid
	X3.8	0.456	0.334	Valid	0.871	0.334	Valid
	X3.9	0.520	0.334	Valid	0.875	0.334	Valid
	X3.10	0.695	0.334	Valid	0.797	0.334	Valid
	X3.11	0.520	0.334	Valid	0.659	0.334	Valid
	X3.12	0.507	0.334	Valid	0.793	0.334	Valid
	X3.13	0.591	0.334	Valid	0.617	0.334	Valid
	X3.14	0.561	0.334	Valid	0.526	0.334	Valid
	X3.15	0.602	0.334	Valid	0.673	0.334	Valid
	X3.16	0.776	0.334	Valid	0.712	0.334	Valid
	X3.17	0.808	0.334	Valid	0.786	0.334	Valid

Table 7.
Cronbach's Alpha for Avoskin

Variable	Cronbach's Alpha	Description
Halal Certification	0.806	Reliable
Brand Ambassador	0.897	Reliable
Beauty Vlogger Review	0.909	Reliable

Table 8.
Cronbach's Alpha for Wardah

Variable	Cronbach's Alpha	Description
Halal Certification	0.665	Reliable
Brand Ambassador	0.939	Reliable
Beauty Vlogger Review	0.952	Reliable

Table 9.
Test of normality for Avoskin

Variable	Shapiro-Wilk		
	Statistic	df	Sig.
Halal Certification	.954	35	.149
Brand Ambassador	.962	35	.257
Beauty Vlogger Review	.924	35	.019

Table 10.
Test of normality for Wardah

Variable	Shapiro-Wilk		
	Statistic	df	Sig.
Halal Certification	.891	35	.002
Brand Ambassador	.927	35	.022
Beauty Vlogger Review	.944	35	.072

3.3. Analysis of normality test

The normality test aims to determine whether the distribution of data in a group of data or variables used is normally distributed or not. This study used the normality test with the Saphiro Wilk method, and the data will be processed with the help of SPSS with an alpha of 0.05. Research data can be normally distributed if the significance value is greater than 0.05. If the significance value is less than 0.05, the research data is not normally distributed. The result of the normality test can be seen in the Table 9-10.

Table 11.
Test of homogeneity

Variable	Levene Statistic	df1	df2	Sig.
Halal Certification	17.323	1	68	.000
Brand Ambassador	1.131	1	68	.291
Beauty Vlogger Review	.879	1	68	.352

Table 12.
U-Test

Variable	Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)	Difference in perception
Halal Certification	.000	Yes
Brand Ambassador	.259	No
Beauty Vlogger Review	.204	No

Table 13.
Mean ranks

Variable	Avoskin	Wardah
Halal Certification	24.60	46.40
Brand Ambassador	32.76	38.24
Beauty Vlogger Review	38.59	32.41

3.4. Analysis of homogeneity test

The homogeneity test was carried out to determine whether the population variants between two or more data groups had the same or different variants. The homogeneity test used is the Levene test method. The decision-making criteria is that if the significance value is > 0.05, then the data is homogeneous (same). On the other hand, if the significance value is < 0.05, the data is heterogeneous (different). The result of the homogeneity test can be seen in the Table 11.

Based on the table shows that the halal certification variable has a sig value of 0.000 < 0.05, then the data is not homogeneous. The brand ambassador variable has a sig value of 0.291 > 0.05, then the data is homogeneous, and the beauty vlogger review variable has a sig value of 0.352 > 0.05, then the data is homogeneous. Because there are variables that have inhomogeneous data, the hypothesis test will be carried out using the Mann Whitney test.

3.5. Analysis of u-test

The Mann-Whitney test is part of non-parametric statistics, so the Mann-Whitney test does not require research data that is normally distributed and homogeneous. If the data that has been analyzed through the normality test and homogeneity test states that the data are not normally distributed and not homogeneous, then the hypothesis test used is the Mann-Whitney test, also called the U-test. This test is used if the data is not normally distributed. The level of significance used in this study is 0.05 or 5%. The basis for the U-test decision is that if the Asymp.Sig value > 0.05 , then H_0 is accepted, and if Asymp.Sig < 0.05 , then H_0 is rejected. The result of the U-test can be seen in the Table 12.

Based on the results of data testing with the Mann-Whitney test, the Asymp Sig value is obtained as $0.000 < 0.05$, so H_0 is rejected, and H_a is accepted. It can be concluded that there are significant differences in perceptions of halal certification between Avoskin and Wardah consumers. Whereas the perception of wardah consumers' halal certification is 46.60 higher than the Avoskin consumer's perception of 24.60 certification. The high perception about halal from Wardah consumers also has been tested from previous research conducted to 232 Moslem women in Indonesia, and this effect to the purchase intention on halal cosmetics [26]. Other study in Selangor Malaysia also has been found that the consumers are having a high level of perception of halal cosmetic products. Besides that, consumers have sufficient knowledge with the attitude towards the halal cosmetic products, which includes the ingredients that are lawful in Syariah law and can avoid sensitive skin and allergic problem. However, the consumers showed a moderate practice level on the halal cosmetic [27]. On the other side most Avoskin consumers do not really care much about halal certification or halal labels when buying Avoskin products. For information, the Avoskin respondents are from Millennial group, age between 18-35, status as student or junior employee, while the characteristic of Wardah consumers in this research about half of them are above 35 years old and status as housewife.

From this different background between two groups can be assumed that Avoskin consumers, represented by younger and active people are not giving much attention on halal issue as the Wardah consumers, they are more interested on issue regarding green concept. This result goes with previous study about halal personal care product's purchase intention was affected significantly by halal marketing and health reason. Halal awareness and certification did not significantly affect the millennial generation's purchase intention of halal personal care products [28]. Therefore, this might be one of the factors that causes Avoskin's skincare sales to be bigger than Wardah's skincare sales in e-commerce.

Based on the results of data testing with the Mann-Whitney test, the value of Asymp Sig. of $0.259 > 0.05$ so H_a is accepted, and H_0 is accepted. It can be concluded that there is no significant difference in the perception of brand ambassadors between Avoskin and Wardah consumers. Whereas the perception of the brand ambassador by Wardah consumers is 38.24 and Avoskin consumers is 32.76. It means both of these two groups agree that brand ambassador is an important tool in marketing for persuading consumers to buy the products. This is in accordance with the research conducted by Utami which found that brand ambassadors have significant results in decision making. purchase of Wardah products [29]. Also, with the result of research from Khotimah & Nurtantiono about the effect of brand ambassador and brand image on purchase decisions for Wardah products in Solo city [30]. This also proves the theory Barnes & Lea-Greenwood [16], which says that brand ambassadors are tools used by companies to communicate and

relate to consumers in the hope of increasing sales.

Based on the results of data testing with the Mann-Whitney test, the value of Asymp Sig. of $0.259 > 0.05$, so H_a is accepted, and H_0 is rejected. It can be concluded that there is no significant difference in the perception of beauty vlogger reviews between Avoskin and Wardah consumers, where the perception of beauty vlogger reviews of Avoskin consumers is 38.59 and Wardah consumers' is 32.4. It means beauty vlogger review is considered important for Avoskin dan Wardah consumers as a useful recommendation for them before buying the products. This is in line with research which found that beauty vlogger reviews have a significant effect on consumer interest. Also, with the research conducted by Nurvia & Sarasati which exposed the influence of beauty vlogger on purchasing decisions involving skincare products [31]. The more credibility and reviews provided by the beauty vlogger, the more consumers' buying interest in the products reviewed will increase. In addition, this is also in line with Shimp's theory which states that there are five attributes (TEARS) to facilitate the communication effectiveness of a celebrity endorser.

4. Conclusions

This study aimed to see if there are differences in consumer perceptions of Avoskin and Wardah skincare using halal certification, brand ambassadors, and beauty vlogger reviews variables. From the results of the tests that have been carried out, the researchers draw the following conclusions: (1) there is a significant difference in perception between Avoskin and Wardah consumers based on halal certification. Wardah has been perceived well as halal cosmetics, include the skincare while Avoskin preferred to be identified as skincare with green concept, (2) there is no significant difference in perception between Avoskin and Wardah consumers based on brand ambassadors. Both of them agree the importance of brand ambassador to persuade consumers buying the products, and (3) there is no significant difference in perception between Avoskin and Wardah consumers based on beauty vlogger reviews. Both of them consider well the recommendation from beauty vlogger reviewer before consuming the product.

It is recommended for Wardah's management to intensify the importance of product halalness so the public is more educated about halalness and consider more to buy halal product, and also can adopt the strategy of green concept with their "own way" or anything that related with current, trendy or millennial stuffs. Hence Wardah can increase their sales numbers. For the management of Avoskin, it is expected to add a halal label on product packaging because most of Avoskin's consumers are Muslim, so that consumers can feel more secure and comfortable when using Avoskin products. It is suggested for further researchers to add more research samples so that they have more observation points and can reflect the actual situation.

Acknowledgement

The authors wish to thank anonymous referess for the valueable feedback.

References

- [1] P. Kotler and K. L. Keller, *A Framework for Marketing Management*, 6th ed. Boston: Pearson, 2016.
- [2] S. Ansari and S. Gupta, "Customer perception of the deceptiveness of online product reviews: A speech act theory perspective," *Int. J. Inf. Manage.*, vol. 57, p. 102286, Apr. 2021, doi: [10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2020.102286](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2020.102286).

- [3] N. Humaira, "ISAS (Attention, Interest, Search, Action, Share) model of cosmetics marketing communication on online beauty forum (Case-Study: Avoskin marketing on Sociolla)," *MEDIALOG J. Ilmu Komun.*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 186–200, Mar. 2021, doi: [10.35326/MEDIALOG.V4I1.1031](https://doi.org/10.35326/MEDIALOG.V4I1.1031).
- [4] R. Damastuti, "Membedah feeds instagram produk skincare lokal (Analisis isi kuantitatif akun instagram Avoskin)," *Perspekt. Komun. J. Ilmu Komun. Polit. dan Komun. Bisnis*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 189–199, Dec. 2021, doi: [10.24853/PK.5.2.189-199](https://doi.org/10.24853/PK.5.2.189-199).
- [5] A. Fathurrahman, and M. Anggesti, "Pengaruh gaya hidup, label halal dan harga terhadap keputusan pembelian kosmetik (Studi Kasus pada Produk Safi)," *JES (Jurnal Ekon. Syariah)*, vol. 6, no. 2, pp. 113–127, Aug. 2021, doi: [10.30736/JESA.V6I2.125](https://doi.org/10.30736/JESA.V6I2.125).
- [6] Y. U. Hoiriyah and Y. Chrismardani, "Pengaruh gaya hidup halal, label halal dan harga terhadap keputusan pembelian Ms Glow (Studi pada mahasiswi Universitas Trunojoyo Madura)," *J. Kaji. Ilmu Manaj.*, vol. 1, no. 2, Aug. 2021, doi: [10.211107/JKIM.V1I2.11590](https://doi.org/10.211107/JKIM.V1I2.11590).
- [7] C. Nisa and D. A. Pramesti, "How Do Effective Digital Marketing and Brand Ambassador Stimulate Purchase Intention Today?" in *Proceedings of the 1st Borobudur International Symposium on Humanities, Economics and Social Sciences (BIS-HESS 2019)*, pp. 365–367, May 2020, doi: [10.2991/ASSEHR.K.200529.075](https://doi.org/10.2991/ASSEHR.K.200529.075).
- [8] R. Ladhari, E. Massa, and H. Skandrani, "YouTube vloggers' popularity and influence: The roles of homophily, emotional attachment, and expertise," *J. Retail. Consum. Serv.*, vol. 54, p. 102027, May 2020, doi: [10.1016/J.JRETCONSER.2019.102027](https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JRETCONSER.2019.102027).
- [9] A. Hamdani, N. Sari, and K. Umuri, "Pengaruh kesadaran halal dan sertifikat halal terhadap minat beli produk Kentucky Fried Chicken (KFC)," *Al-Buhits*, vol. 17, no. 2, pp. 198–212, Dec. 2021, doi: [10.30603/ab.v17i2.2305](https://doi.org/10.30603/ab.v17i2.2305).
- [10] K. F. Nanda and R. Ikawati, "Hubungan persepsi label halal MUI terhadap minat beli produk makanan pada mahasiswa Fakultas Ilmu Kesehatan Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta," *J. Food Culin.*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 1–9, Jun. 2020, doi: [10.12928/JFC.V3I1.3597](https://doi.org/10.12928/JFC.V3I1.3597).
- [11] E. D. Setyaningsih and S. Marwansyah, "The effect of halal certification and halal awareness through interest in decisions on buying halal food products," *Syi'ar Iqtishadi J. Islam. Econ. Financ. Bank.*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 65–79, May 2019, doi: [10.35448/JIEC.V3I1.5515](https://doi.org/10.35448/JIEC.V3I1.5515).
- [12] P. W. Widyaningrum, "Pengaruh label halal, kesadaran halal, iklan, dan celebrity endorser terhadap minat pembelian kosmetik melalui variabel persepsi sebagai mediasi (Studi Pada civitas akademika Universitas Muhammadiyah Ponorogo)," *Capital: Jurnal Ekonomi dan Manajemen*, vol. 2, no. 2, p. 74, Feb. 2019, doi: [10.25273/capital.v2i2.3984](https://doi.org/10.25273/capital.v2i2.3984).
- [13] M. F. Iltiham and M. Nizar, "Pengaruh label halal Majelis Ulama Indonesia (MUI), harga pada oleh-oleh makanan khas Pasuruan terhadap minat beli dan keputusan pembelian," *Malia*, vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 311–326, 2020, doi: [10.35891/ml.v11i2.2149](https://doi.org/10.35891/ml.v11i2.2149).
- [14] Teng, P. K. and Wan Jusoh, W. J., "Investigating student awareness and usage intention towards Halal labelled cosmetics and personal care products in Malaysia," in *4th International Conference on Business and Economic Research (4th ICBER 2013)*, Indonesia: Bandung, 2013.
- [15] M. Muizzudin and S. A. Kisty, "Pengaruh sertifikasi halal, citra merek, dan harga terhadap keputusan pembelian minuman Teh Botol Sosro (Studi Kasus pada Mahasiswa Pendidikan Tinggi Islamic Village)," *Islamonomics: Journal of Islamic Economics, Business and Finance*, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 137–151, Dec. 2020, doi: [10.47903/ji.v10i2.132](https://doi.org/10.47903/ji.v10i2.132).
- [16] L. Barnes and G. Lea-Greenwood, "Pre-loved? Analysing the Dubai Luxe Resale Market," *Vintage Luxury Fashion*, pp. 63–78, 2018, doi: [10.1007/978-3-319-71985-6_5](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-71985-6_5).
- [17] Y. Hendayana and N. Afifah, "Pengaruh brand ambassador dan Korean wave terhadap minat belanja online melalui marketplace Tokopedia," *Kinerja*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 32–46, Mar. 2021, doi: [10.34005/kinerja.v3i1.1285](https://doi.org/10.34005/kinerja.v3i1.1285).
- [18] N. Lailiya, "Pengaruh brand ambassador dan kepercayaan terhadap keputusan pembelian di Tokopedia," *IQTISHADequity jurnal MANAJEMEN*, vol. 2, no. 2, p. 113, Oct. 2020, doi: [10.51804/iej.v2i2.764](https://doi.org/10.51804/iej.v2i2.764).
- [19] N. Hidayati and L. Yuliani, "Pengaruh beauty vlogger, citra merek dan label halal terhadap minat beli produk kosmetik Wardah," *JSMA (Jurnal Sains Manajemen dan Akuntansi)*, vol. 12, no. 1, pp. 65–76, May 2020, doi: [10.37151/jsma.v12i1.50](https://doi.org/10.37151/jsma.v12i1.50).
- [20] J.-L. Chen and A. Dermawan, "The influence of youtube beauty vloggers on Indonesian consumers' purchase intention of local cosmetic products," *International Journal of Business and Management*, vol. 15, no. 5, p. 100, Apr. 2020, doi: [10.5539/ijbm.v15n5p100](https://doi.org/10.5539/ijbm.v15n5p100).
- [21] E. P. Supriyanto and K. S. Sinduwiatmo, "Consumer perception of Wardah cosmetic products," *Academia Open*, vol. 5, Aug. 2021, doi: [10.21070/acopen.5.2021.2209](https://doi.org/10.21070/acopen.5.2021.2209).
- [22] R. M. Isrofi, "Endorsement of 'Blue Tick' Celebgram: A New Phenomenon of Marketing Strategies Increasing Product Sales (Case Study on Instagram Account @avoskin)," *ARISTO*, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 350–369, Jun. 2022, doi: [10.24269/ars.v10i2.4869](https://doi.org/10.24269/ars.v10i2.4869).
- [23] K. Sugibayashi et al., "Halal Cosmetics: A Review on Ingredients, Production, and Testing Methods," *Cosmetics*, vol. 6, no. 3, p. 37, Jul. 2019, doi: [10.3390/cosmetics6030037](https://doi.org/10.3390/cosmetics6030037).
- [24] X. Li, "How powerful is the female gaze? The implication of using male celebrities for promoting female cosmetics in China," *Global Media and China*, vol. 5, no. 1, pp. 55–68, Jan. 2020, doi: [10.1177/2059436419899166](https://doi.org/10.1177/2059436419899166).
- [25] S. A. Saputri and I. Novitaningtyas, "Analisis pengaruh kualitas produk dan review beauty vlogger terhadap keputusan pembelian pada produk kosmetik," *AMONG MAKARTI*, vol. 15, no. 1, Jun. 2022, doi: [10.52353/ama.v15i1.243](https://doi.org/10.52353/ama.v15i1.243).
- [26] S. A. Savitri and R. Erdiansyah, "Pengaruh citra, kredibilitas dan kemampuan komunikasi beauty vlogger terhadap keputusan pembelian produk make-up Maybelline (Studi Kasus Tasya Farasya)," *Prologia*, vol. 3, no. 1, p. 267, Dec. 2019, doi: [10.24912/pr.v3i1.6250](https://doi.org/10.24912/pr.v3i1.6250).
- [27] N. Muhamad and A. Latiff, "Perception of consumer towards halal labelled cosmetic products in Selangor," *International Journal of Community Development and Management Studies*, vol. 3, pp. 057–064, Dec. 2019, Accessed: Jul. 17, 2022. [Online]. Available: <https://www.informingscience.org/Publications/4466>
- [28] F. Mahliza and P. Prasetya, "Determining purchase intention in halal personal care product: Study on muslimah millennial generation," *Jurnal Aplikasi Manajemen*, vol. 19, no. 2, pp. 319–334, Jun. 2021, doi: [10.21776/ub.jam.2021.019.02.08](https://doi.org/10.21776/ub.jam.2021.019.02.08).
- [29] R. H. Utami, "Analisis pengaruh keputusan pembelian pada kosmetik berlabel halal," *BMAJ: Business Management Analysis Journal*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 68–77, Apr. 2019, doi: [10.24176/bmaj.v2i1.3212](https://doi.org/10.24176/bmaj.v2i1.3212).
- [30] K. Khotimah and A. Nurtantiono, "Pengaruh produk, persepsi harga, promosi dan gaya hidup terhadap keputusan pembelian produk Wardah di Solo Raya," *Creative Research Management Journal*, vol. 4, no. 1, p. 1, Jun. 2021, doi: [10.32663/crmj.v4i1.1827](https://doi.org/10.32663/crmj.v4i1.1827).
- [31] O. Nurvia and B. Sarasati, "The Influence of beauty vloggers on purchasing decisions involving skin care products," *KnE Social Sciences*, Jan. 2021, doi: [10.18502/kss.v4i15.8191](https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v4i15.8191).