The Political Identity of Ethnicity in the Local Election of Makassar City 2018

Asfar Mutaaly Barelly[1][*], Muhammad[1], Gustiana A Kambo[1], Abdillah[2]

[1]Department of Political Science, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Hasanuddin University of Makassar
[2]Researcher of Media Ilmiah Center (MIC)

*Corresponding Author: Mutaaly7@gmail.com

Abstract: *The emergence of ethnic politics begins with the growth of awareness that identifies them as belonging to a particular ethnic group or group. This awareness then gave rise to group solidarity and a sense of nationality. In the context of local political dynamics in Makassar City, it is inevitable that there will be a struggle for ethnic identity politics in the struggle for the throne of power. This research method uses a qualitative-exploratory approach with a phenomenological approach, namely exploring the phenomenon of ethnic identity politics in the struggle for the throne of power in Makassar City. Data analysis using Nvivo 12 Pro qualitative research tools. The results of the study show the phenomenon of ethnic identity politics in the Makassar City Election as seen in ethnic political attacks on political communication [original Makassarese] and [immigrants] during the 2018 Makassar City Election. The victory of an empty city in the 2018 Makassar mayoral election has been described as a democratic victory. for the little people and the defeat of the local political elite. This can trigger the growth and widespread practice of ethnic identity politics in the upcoming Pilkada in Makassar City. The birth of resentment from local political elites, which is reflected in the attacks of identity politics through political communication [We are 100% Makassar, while he is 100% Gorontalo] will exacerbate political and social instability in the Makassar City area. Therefore, the maturity of the local elite is needed to create local political qualities. This political maturity will have an impact on improving the quality of politics and making local political battles more productive and healthy.*
Keywords: etnhic identity politics; local politics; contestation.

Introduction

Ethnic involvement in political contestation is not a rare thing. In various African countries such as Nigeria and Somalia during the 1970s and 1980s, ethnic forces became an important factor in determining political positions. In Indonesia, ethnic movements to enter the realm of practical politics have occurred after the political liberalization that has been going on since 1998 (Saleh, et al., 2018; Heyes, 2007; Luhur & Abdillah, 2020), Until now, it has also colored Indonesia's local political contestation.

For C. Heyes (2007), identity politics is more focused on the interests of marginalized individuals or groups rather than organizing and social. In every community, even though they have ideologies and have a common goal, it cannot be denied that there are various kinds of individuals who have their own personalities and identities. This is because individual personalities and identities are different and unique. Individuals with ego and personal goals may dominate (Lebow, 2012; Abdillah et al., 2021). This causes a shift in interests related to the struggle for power and competition to get a strategic political position for each individual and also the group (Saleh et al., 2018; Mukmin, 2012). The strengthening of identity politics in the local sphere coincides with the politics of decentralization. After the enactment of Law no. 22/1999, the identity politics movement became clearer. In fact, many local and national political actors consciously use this issue in power-sharing (Haboddin, 2012).

The local political contestation of Makassar City is colored by an ethnic oppositional dichotomy (Syaf, 2017) as seen through the political language, like I am [We are real] and he is [He who is an immigrant], [We are 100% Makassar, while he is 100% Gorontalo], [We are the sons of the region, He is not], along [We are supposed to participate in the mayoral election, And naturalized citizens shouldn't], very prominent in the public space of Makassar residents. Towards the election day for the Mayor of Makassar, to be precise on June 27 2018, negative campaigns began to flare up (FajarNews, 2020). propaganda by utilizing political attributes in the form of leaflets/flyers were distributed to almost all areas digitally and in print to the residents of Makassar City. The contents vary, but what stands out is the content of the leaflets which emphasizes the oppositional status of who is [the Makassar native] and who is an immigrant or known as Ethnic Identity Politics. The response of Danny Pomanto who is currently the Mayor of Makassar regarding the rise of negative campaign content related to ethnic identity politics:

According to Danny Pomanto, Talking about identity politics certainly has its own role. However, based on my political experience so far, the victory of the empty box in the 2018 election is proof of the victory of the people without a party identity (Makssarmetro, 2021).

In Syaf's research (2017), it is stated that the attack on ethnic identity in the Makassar City election contestation was primarily aimed at fighting the political power of one of the candidates for the mayor of Makassar, namely Ramdhan Danny Pomanto. Makassar political figures who are seen as not representing parts of the Bugis-Makassarese or Toraja-Mandar ethnic groups, as the majority of the ethnic composition of Makassar city residents.

Ramdhan Pomanto or better known as Danny Pomanto does not have a background, history of origin with Makassar or Bugis blood. His father, Buluku Pomanto, is from North Gorontalo district and so is his mother. It is this background of historical differences in origin that is used as the basis by a group of political elites to highlight ethnic sentiments, attacking Ramdhan Pomanto who is seen as having no history of origins from South Sulawesi (Syaf, 2017; Pradadimara, 2003). This reason became the strength of identity politics for political

opponents when the Makassar City election took place. Figure 1 below serves as a visualization of identification related to the research issues that will be studied in this study. In connection with the politics of ethnic identity in the Makassar City Election, which explains the relationship and connection with other important issues, as follows

Figure 1. Analysis & Identification of Research Issues

Source: Processed by Researchers from Nvivo 12 Pro, 2021

There are several reasons why the political pull of ethnicity is getting stronger in the regional head election system. The first is the strengthening of the ethnocentrism phenomenon (Kurien, 2001; Monroe, 2011) in direct regional head elections which often violate the rules of the game from democratic procedures. Second, in terms of regulation of the Election Law No. 7/2017, especially in the election of legislative members related to the determination of the elected candidate (Saleh & Rosyidi, 2018; Mukmin, 2012). Third, the inability of political parties in the regions to carry out their proper functions, especially in terms of civic education and political recruitment patterns (Beer & Camp, 2016; Fox & Lawless, 2010). Fourth, is the weak regulation of Law No. 23/2014 which does not contain strict provisions regarding the limits and sanctions of punishment when racist issues arise in every election (Gustomy, 2021; Saleh & Rosyidi, 2018: Mukmin, 2012). If it is not taken seriously regarding the politics of ethnic identity that occurs, it will have a negative impact on the occurrence of ideological confrontations that disrupt productive social stability (Hamidah, 2018; Syofian et al., 2020) in Makassar City.

Based on the study of ethnic identity politics in local political contestation in Makassar City. Then a fundamental question arises, how did the face of ethnic identity politics play a role in disqualifying Danny Pomanto & winning the Empty City in the 2018 Makassar City

Election? Moreover, the percentage of Gorontalo ethnicity only reaches 1,2% (BPS Kota Makassar, 2020) of the total population of Makassar City.

Methods

This study uses a qualitative-exploratory method with a phenomenological approach (Creswell & Poth, 2016) as an exploration of the phenomenon of identity politics in the struggle for the throne of power in Makassar City which has an impact on unhealthy and unproductive struggles. The data and facts used are obtained through library research by studying, reading, studying books, journals, official documents and other relevant data sources so as to produce qualified research. Once obtained, the data is then analyzed and interpreted as developed by Miles, Huberman, & Saldana (2014) with the stages of data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and data verification, to produce conclusions. In the form of new findings that will be useful for readers in seeing the phenomenon of the face of ethnic identity politics in local political battles specifically for Political Contest in Makassar City. Then assisted with qualitative research tools Nvivo 12 Pro (Woolf & Silver, 2017) to explore more

deeply the problems that occurred and get the best conclusions.

Results and Discussion
The Dynamics of Makassar City Election 2018

In March 2018, the KPU determined the number of temporary voters as many as 862,731 people spread across 15 sub-districts in Makassar City. Voters will cast their ballots at 2,765 polling stations. Budget of Rp. 60 billion (USD 4.35 million) was spent on holding the pilkada. Rp. 16.4 billion of which came from the 2017 APBD (Regional Expenditure Revenue Budget) and the rest from the 2018 APBD (KPU Kota Makassar, 2018a).

Party candidate registration is open from 8 to 10 January 2018, while the independent candidate registration is open from 22 to 26 November 2017. The campaign period starts on 15 February and ends on 24 June, then the campaign period is quiet for three days. Voting takes place on 27 June. This general election adopts the system of most winners (first past the post). Candidates will receive serial numbers on February 13, 2018 (Munsir, 2017). The candidates for the 2018 Makassar mayoral election were initially determined by the Makassar City KPU as follows.

Table 1. Candidates in the 2018 Makassar City Election

Serial number	Candidate Pair Name	Political Parties	initials
1.	Munafri Afiruddin Andi Rahmatika Dewi	Partai NasDem Golkar PDI-P Gerindra Hanura PKB PPP	Appi-Cicu

			PBB	
			PKS	
			PKPI	
(Disqualification)	Mohammad Pomanto Indira Mulyasari	Ramdhan	Independen	Diami

Source: Prepared by Researchers from various sources, 2021

Munafri Arifuddin is a member of Golkar and the nephew of Jusuf Kalla, supported by 10 parties. As CEO of PSM Makassar football club, he promised to continue to lead the club if elected. Arifuddin's partner, Rachmatika Dewi, is the deputy chairman of the DPRD and the head of Nasdem in Makassar. Although there are few political parties supporting him, Mohammad Ramdhan Pomanto registered with the KPU as an independent candidate after receiving 117,492 photocopies of ID cards; the requirement to advance as an independent candidate is to get ~65,000 photocopies of ID cards. The Democrats are the only party in the DPRD that supports him. Other parties had supported Pomanto, but withdrew later. His running mate, Indira Mulyasari, was the deputy chairman of the DPRD, but he withdrew to take part in this election (Alfian, 2018).

In February, the Munafri-Dewi pair sued the KPU to cancel Pomanto's candidacy on the grounds that Pomanto distributed smartphones while serving as mayor. On March 21, the South Sulawesi State Administrative High Court ordered the KPU to cancel Pomanto's candidacy. The KPU then took the case to the Supreme Court, which also strengthened the PTTUN's decision. Pomanto stated that he would fight his case legally. However, the KPU decided to disqualify Pomanto in a closed meeting so that this election was followed by a single candidate. Arifuddin still needs to win a majority of votes (voters can choose an empty column) or the election will be repeated in 2020 (Kompas, 2018). It is stated in the research by Purwaningsih & Widodo (2021) that the 2018 Makassar City Election is actually not an empty box, but a representation of incumbents who are disqualified from the regional head election. At the same time, the victory of the empty box in the 2018 Makassar City Election is a democracy without contestation.

Ethnic Identity Politics: The Other Side in Makassar City Mayor Election

In his research, Mukmin (2012) explained that the rise of ethnic politics in the local elections can be interpreted by the absence of democratic certainty at the local level. In other words, democracy also forces the emergence of a fierce competition for power. Borrowing the term used by Parsudi Suparlan (Mukmin, 2012: 53) which is contained in Bima Sugiarto's work that the mobilization of ethnic networks was deliberately created to win a competition in terms of power struggle.

As Abdillah (2002) said, identity politics is another name for biopolitics and the politics of difference. The emergence of ethnic politics begins with the growth of

awareness that identifies them as belonging to a particular ethnic group or group. This awareness then gave rise to group solidarity and a sense of nationality. In the dynamics of local politics in Makassar City, in the struggle for regional political power, the struggle for ethnic identity politics in the Makassar City Election is unavoidable. In a study conducted by Kristianus (2016) on politics and ethnic culture strategies in winning the Pilkada found that the occurrence of ethnic identity politics in the Pilkada contestation was because history recorded that the ruling ethnic elite always carried out ethnic hegemony over other ethnic groups. In Haboddin's research (2012), the reason for the occurrence of identity politics in the regions is due to the

political elite using it as an effective political tool when negotiating with other political entities. In addition, Haboddin (2012) said that identity politics is usually used by political elites as political rhetoric as we are for [original people] who want power against them for [immigrants]. This phenomenon of ethnic identity politics also manifests itself in local political contestations such as the Pilwali in Makassar City.

It can be seen through political language, [We are natives] and [He is immigrants], [We are 100% Makassar, while he is 100% Gorontalo], [We are sons of the region, He is not] (Syaf, 2017). Below will describe the situation in the 2018 Makassar City Election:

Table 2. Voting for the 2018 Makassar Mayor Election

No.	Candidate Pair Name	Voting	Percentage (%)
1.	Appi – Cicu	264.245	46,77%
2.	Empty Box	300.795	53,23%
3.	Number of Valid Votes	565.040	96,69%
4	Number of Invalid Votes	19.366	3,31%
5	Voter Participation	584.406	57,20%
6	Registered Voters	1.021.714	100%

Source: Prepared by Researchers from various sources, 2021

From table 2 above, it can be seen that Appi-Cicu gained 264,245 votes (46.77%). Meanwhile, the people who chose the empty box were 300,795 votes (53.23%), while the invalid votes were 19,366 (3.31%). Of the total voter participation as many as 584,406 (57.20%) in the number of registered

voters as many as 1,021,714 people (KPU Kota Makassar, 2018b; KPU, 2018). From the votes obtained in the 2018 Makassar City Election, the Empty Box was determined by the Makassar City KPU (General Election Commissions) as the winner in the 2018 Makassar City Election (KPU Kota Makassar, 2018b).

Table 3. Three Reasons for Danny Pomanto's Disqualification in the 2018 Makassar City Election

No.	the reason	court ruling
1.	Giving cellphones to RT/RW (Neighborhood Association) while serving as mayor of the previous period.	The Decision of the Makassar State Administrative High Court (PTUN)
2.	Appointment of contract workers while serving as mayor of the previous period.	The Decision of the Makassar State Administrative High Court (PTUN)
3.	Use of taglines 2x+baik while serving as mayor of the previous period.	The Decision of the Makassar State Administrative High Court (PTUN)

Source: Prepared by researchers from Alfian (2018), 2021

Table 3 above explains that there are three reasons for the decision of the Makassar State Administrative High Court (PTUN) on the lawsuit of the Makassar Mayor & Deputy Mayor, Munafri Arifuddin-Andi Rachmatika Dewi (Appi-Cicu) legal team. The verdict was read directly by the presiding judge, Edi Suprianto, on Wednesday 21 March 2018 in Makassar City. Behind the victory of the Empty City & Danny Pomanto's disqualification, the author sees the occurrence of identity politics in the 2018 Makassar City Election. This indicates that the political elite of Makassar City is still using Identity Politics as a political weapon in local political contestation in Makassar City. This is the author's concern to see the impact of the influence of ethnic identity politics in Makassar City so that in the 2020 election, Danny Pomanto won (Kurniawan, 2020). This phenomenon leads to uncertainty and socio-political instability in Makassar as well as a threat to the local political elite of Makassar. As stated by Hamidah (2018) and Syofian et al., (2020) the negative impact that occurs if the rise of local ethnic identity politics leads to regional productive social instability.

Based on the analysis of the author's research on ethnic identity politics in the mayoral election of Makassar City, identity politics will sometimes lead to irrational thoughts on his behavior. So that efforts to justify any means to win are increasingly being carried out, thus worsening the quality of the election. This irrationality will lead to an excessive level of sensitivity to a form of inter-ethnic problem. Irrationality will also bring a radical nature that makes the local political atmosphere increasingly heated, which will later lead to a protracted conflict.

The victory of the Empty City in the 2018 Makassar mayoral election and the defeat by political elite figures could trigger future increases and widespread practice of ethnic identity politics in the contestation of regional head elections in Makassar and other regions. This will

exacerbate the political-social instability that exists in the region. In order to see the practice of ethnic identity politics in local politics, the political maturity of the local elite is required.This political maturity will improve the quality of politics and make local political contestations more productive and effective.

Borrowing Anderson's (2006) term that the concept of the Indonesian nation is an [imagination] is a consequence that the Indonesian nation must carry when the ethnic diversity that has been the pride of the nation as a unifier of the nation can cause a ticking time bomb for the emergence of various kinds of communal conflicts when each ethnic groups maintain their existence in the midst of rapid changes in political currents.

The Intersection of Ethnic Identity Politics in the Makassar City Election

Ethnic identity politics in Makassar City is increasingly widespread, as evidenced by the research of Prianto, et al., (2021: 81-82) on local democracy and the election of regional heads for single candidate pairs. This study shows that voter behavior in South Sulawesi, including Makassar City, carries out identity politics. The findings of this study indicate that the tendency of voter behavior to see candidates during the Pilkada by looking at the same place of origin, ethnicity, and religious factors are the most influential things in local political contestation in South Sulawesi.

In a study conducted by Prianto, et al., (2021) to prove and complement previous studies that tried to explain ethnic identity politics that occurred in Makassar City. Based on this research, it can be said that the practice of identity politics that occurs in Makassar City does not only come from the political elite but is also carried out by voters and supporters of the community in local political contestation in Makassar. Therefore the Makassar mayoral election (Pilwali) in 2020 yesterday became one of the hottest competitions in the 2020 simultaneous regional elections (Pemilukada). There are two reasons for that. First, the smell of complaints that are still thick with the tragedy of the empty boxing victory in the 2018 Pilwali, competing. Memories of the 2018 Pilkada in Makassar are memories that will be remembered by all parties. For the first time in 2018, the victory of the empty box also became an important story for political dynamics in Indonesia. This phenomenon is also a strange but real political anomaly. This phenomenon is happened because as stated by Heyes (2007) that identity politics is more directed to the interests of marginalized individuals or groups rather than organizing and social. Leach, et al., (2008) said that ethnic identity politics is a dialectical struggle for power by dominant and subordinate groups using ethnicity.

Haboddin (2012: 116-134) concludes in his research, strengthening ethnicity politics is a self-portrait of local political struggles. A double-faced portrait. His first face was in the form of a regional son. Another facet of identity politics can be manifested in the struggle for allocation of funds from the central government. Where the process of political decentralization turned out to be accompanied by the issue of the sons of the region. An issue that is full of meaning and very worrying, not only the local democratic process will be threatened but

also an indication of the waning of the spirit of nationalism.

The phenomenon of ethnic identity politics in the Makassar City Election can be seen in the ethnic political attack on political communication, I [a native Makassarese] and he [a migrant] in the Makassar City Mayor Election. At the level of ethnic identity politics, at least

liberalization can be seen from the availability of space for each community to form their own community. This can protect their rights, and also reduce the nation's intervention in the political appreciation of each group. However, there are still some parties who play an ethnic role in the political victory in the Makassar City Election.

Figure 2. Ethnic Identity Politics in Makassar City Mayor Election

Source: Processed by Researchers from Nvivo 12 Pro, 2021

Based on the analysis of the author's research in figure 2 above, the

politics of ethnic identity in the mayoral election of Makassar City is that the

politics of ethnic identity tends to cause irrational thoughts on their behavior. There are two main reasons why identity politics emerges in local political contestations:(1) Throughout history, the ruling local ethnic elite has always exercised ethnic hegemony over other ethnic groups; and (2) local political elites use it as an effective political tool when negotiating with other political entities. Ethnic identity politics in the mayoral election of Makassar occurred through a process of political communication as political rhetoric as we are for [original people] who want power against them for [immigrants]. The victory of the Empty City in the 2018 Makassar mayoral election, which was referred to as the victory of small people's democracy and the defeat by political elite figures. It can trigger the increasing and widespread practice of ethnic identity politics in the contestation of future regional head elections in Makassar City, as well as in other regions. The emergence of resentment from local political elites, which is reflected in the attacks of identity politics through political communication [We are 100% Makassar, while he is 100% Gorontalo], will exacerbate political and social instability in the Makassar City area. Therefore, the maturity of the local elite is needed to create local political qualities. This political maturity will have an impact on improving the quality of politics and making local political battles more productive and healthy. In line with what was said by Leach, et al., (2008) the possibility of ethnic-based identity politics is mushrooming in the future. This will exacerbate the political-social instability that exists in the region. In order to see the practice of ethnic identity politics in local

politics, the political maturity of the local elite is required.This political maturity will improve the quality of politics and make local political contestations more productive and effective.

Conclusion

Based on the author's analysis, it is concluded that the politics of ethnic identity tends to lead to irrational thoughts on their behavior. There are 2 common reasons why identity politics occurs in local political contestations, namely: (1) History records that the ruling local ethnic elite has always exercised ethnic hegemony over other ethnic groups; and (2) local political elites use it as an effective political tool when negotiating with other political entities. Ethnic identity politics in the Makassar mayoral election occurred through a process of political communication as political rhetoric as we [the natives] wanted power against them for [the immigrants]. The victory of the Empty City in the 2018 Makassar mayoral election was called the victory of the democracy of the small people and the defeat of political elite figures. This fact can trigger the increasing and widespread practice of ethnic identity politics in the future regional head election contestation in Makassar City, as well as in other regions. This will exacerbate the political-social instability that exists in the region. So that the political maturity of the local elite is very necessary in seeing the practice of ethnic identity politics in local local political contestations. This political maturity will improve the quality of politics and make local political contestations more productive and healthy.

About Author

Asfar Mutaaly Barelly is from Department of Political Science, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, "Hasanuddin University of Makassar". His research interest is related to Ethnic Identity Politics in Local Political Contests.

Muhammad is a lecturer in "Hasanuddin University of Makassar". He graduated with a Bachelor's Degree (S1) from Hasanuddin University, Political Science S1 Study Program. Then completed his Masters in Social Sciences at Airlangga University. Then earned a Doctorate in Social Sciences at Airlangga University. His research interest is related to the study of Political Sociology.

Gustiana A. Kambo is a lecturer in "Hasanuddin University Makassar". He graduated with a bachelor's degree (S1) from the Political Science S1 Study Program at Hasanuddin University. Then he continued his Masters in Social Sciences at Airlangga University and then earned a Doctorate in Social Sciences at Airlangga University. Her research interest is related to the Study of Identity Politics.

Abdillah is a Young Researcher at the Scientific Media Center (MIC). His research interests relate to Ethnic Identity Politics in Local Political Contests, Rural Local Government, Agency Dynamics of Local Government, Local Self-Government, and Government Relations Patterns.

References

Abdillah S, U. (2002). *Politik Identitas Etnis: Pergulatan Tanda Tanpa Identitas*. Indonesiatera.

Abdillah, A., Prastio, L. O., & Effendi, S. N. (2021). Analisis Alienasi Sosial Karl Marx dalam Kebijakan Sistem Pemagangan Nasional Indonesia. *Jurnal Identitas*, *1*(2), 48-61. https://doi.org/10.52496/identitas.v1i2.155

Alfian. (2018). PT TUN Perintahkan Diskualifikasi Danny-Indira, Ternyata Inilah 3 Kesalahan Sang Perahana. [online] available at https://makassar.tribunnews.com/2018/03/21/pt-tun-perintahkan-diskualifikasi-danny-indira-ternyata-inilah-3-kesalahan-sang-petahana accessed on October 2021

Anderson, B. (2006). *Imagined communities: Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. Verso books.

Beer, C. C., & Camp, R. A. (2016). Democracy, gender quotas, and political recruitment in Mexico. *Politics, Groups, and Identities*, *4*(2), 179-195. https://doi.org/10.1080/21565503.2015.1120223

BPS Kota Makassar. (2020). Kota Makassar Dalam Angka: 2021. [online] available at https://makassarkota.bps.go.id/publication/ accessed on October 2021

Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2016). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage publications.

FajarNEWS. (2020). Pilkada Makassar Memanas! Serangan Black Campaign di Masa Tenang. [online] available at https://fajar.co.id/2020/12/08/pilk

ada-makassar-memanas-serangan-black-campaign-di-masa-tenang/ accessed on October 2021

Fox, R. L., & Lawless, J. L. (2010). If only they'd ask: Gender, recruitment, and political ambition. *The Journal of Politics*, *72*(2), 310-326. https://doi.org/10.1017/S00223816 09990752

Gustomy, R. (2021). Governability, New Development, and Rural Economy at Sanankerto Village, Indonesia. *Journal of Governance*, *6*(1), 1-12. http://dx.doi.org/10.31506/jog.v6i1. 9478

Haboddin, M. (2012). Menguatnya politik identitas di ranah lokal. *Jurnal Studi Pemerintahan*, *3*(1), 116-134. http://dx.doi.org/10.18196/jgp.201 2.0007

Hamidah, K. (2018). The Trend of Emerging Identity Politics in Indonesia and the Challenge in Fostering Social Cohesion: Lesson Learned from Jakarta Provincial Election. *Karsa: Jurnal Sosial Dan Budaya Keislaman*, *26*(1), 91-109. https://doi.org/10.19105/karsa.v26i 1.1653

Heyes, C. J. (2007). *Self-transformations: Foucault, ethics, and normalized bodies*. Oxford University Press.

Kompas. (2018). Calon Tunggal di Pilkada Makassar 2018 Bantah Kalah dari Kota Kosong. [online] available at https://regional.kompas.com/read/ 2018/06/28/08141501/calon-tunggal-di-pilkada-makassar-2018-bantah-kalah-dari-kotak-kosong accessed on October 2021

KPU Kota Makassar. (2018a). Info Pilkada. [online] available at https://kota-makassar.kpu.go.id/web/info-pilkada/ accessed on oktober 2021

KPU Kota Makassar. (2018b). Pilwali Kota Makasar 2018: Rekapitulasi Hasil Suara Pemilihan Walikota dan Wakil Walikota Makassar 2018. [online] available at https://kota-makassar.kpu.go.id/web/db1-kwk-pilwali-2018/ accessed on October 2021

KPU. (2018). Lindung Hak Pilihmu. [online] available at https://lindungihakpilihmu.kpu.go.id / accessed on oktober 2021

Kristianus, K. (2016). Politik dan Strategi Budaya Etnik dalam Pilkada Serentak di Kalimantan Barat. *Politik Indonesia: Indonesian Political Science Review*, *1*(1), 87-101. https://doi.org/10.15294/jpi.v1i1.9 182

Kurien, P. (2001). Religion, ethnicity and politics: Hindu and Muslim Indian immigrants in the United States. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, *24*(2), 263-293. https://doi.org/10.1080/174490505 00229842

Kurniawan. (2020). Pilkada Makassar, Memori kotak Kosong, dan Pembelajaran Demokrasi. [online] available at https://news.detik.com/kolom/d-5239193/pilkada-makassar-memori-kotak-kosong-dan-pembelajaran-demokrasi accessed on October 2021

Leach, C. W., Brown, L. M., & Worden, R. E. (2008). Ethnicity and identity politics. *Science*, *32*(3), 415-434. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-012373985-8.00063-5

Lebow, R. N. (2012). *The politics and ethics of identity: In search of ourselves*. Cambridge University Press.

Luhur, A., & Abdillah, A. (2020). Dekolonisasi dan Indegenisasi Ilmu Pemerintahan. *GOVERNABILITAS (Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*

Semesta), *1*(2), 164-186. https://doi.org/10.47431/governabilitas.v1i2.86

Makassarmetro. (2021). Bicara Politik Identitas, Wali Kota Makassar Sebut Kotak Kosong Kemenangan Rayat. [online] Available at https://makassarmetro.com/2021/06/04/bicara-politik-identitas-wali-kota-makassar-sebut-kotak-kosong-kemenangan-rakyat accessed on October 2021

Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook.

Monroe, K. R. (2011). Ethics in an age of terror and genocide: Identity and moral choice. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, *44*(3), 503-507. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1049096511000795

Mukmin, B. A. (2012). Politik Identitas Etnis Dalam Kontestasi Politik Lokal. *Jurnal Kewarganegaraan*, *19*(02), 52-60.

Munsir, I. (2017). Pasangan Danny-Indira Lolos Maju Peseorangan di Pilwali Makassar. [online] available at https://news.detik.com/berita/d-3792142/pasangan-danny-indira-lolos-maju-peseorangan-di-pilwalkot-makassar accessed on October 2021

Pradadimara, D. (2003). Dari Makassar Ke Makassar: Aspek Demografi Dan Politik Proses "Etnisasi" Sebuah Kota. *Populasi*, *14*(1). https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/290178947.pdf

Prianto, A. L., Malik, I., Rusnaedy, Z., Khaerah, N., Abdillah, A., Lestari, D., & Angraini, A. (2021). Demokrasi Lokal Dan Pemilihan Kepala Daerah Pasangan Calon Tunggal. Gowa: SubalternInti Media

Purwaningsih, T., & Widodo, B. E. C. (2021). Democracy without contestation: the victory of the empty box in the local election of Makassar city, South Sulawesi Indonesia in 2018. *Sociology and Technoscience*, *11*(2), 48-71. https://doi.org/10.24197/st.2.2021.48-71

Saleh, M., & Rosyidi, B. (2018). Politik Identitas Etnis Dalam Pemilihan Kepala Daerah. Studi Kasus: Peranan Etnis Tionghoa Dalam Pilkada Kota Tebing Tinggi Tahun 2017. *Ganaya: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Humaniora*, *1*(2), 240-254. http://jayapanguspress.penerbit.org/index.php/ganaya/article/view/101

Syaf, E. J. (2017). Pertarungan Simbol Identitas Etnis Sebagai Komunikasi Politik Dalam Pilkada Kota Makassar. *KAREBA: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi*, 215-224. Doi; https://doi.org/10.31947/kjik.v6i2.5274

Syofian, E., Subhilhar, S., Kusmanto, H., & Amin, M. (2020). Identity Politics in the 2018 Regional Head Elections for the Governor and Deputy Governor of North Sumatra. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*, *3*(4), 3675-3685. https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v3i4.1424

Woolf, N. H., & Silver, C. (2017). *Qualitative analysis using NVivo: The five-level QDA® method*. Routledge.